Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales

Y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc
The Children and Young People Committee

Dydd Mercher, 18 Ionawr 2012
Wednesday, 18 January 2012

Cynnwys
Contents

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

Gweithredu Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth Implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009: Evidence Session

Cynnig Gweithdrefnol
Procedural Motion

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Angela Burns	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Christine Chapman	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Committee Chair)
Jocelyn Davies	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Keith Davies	Llafur Labour
Suzy Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour
Lynne Neagle	Llafur Labour
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur Labour
Aled Roberts	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Simon Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Eifion Evans	Cyfarwyddwr yr Adran Addysg a Gwasanaethau Cymunedol, Cyngor Sir Ceredigion Director of Education and Community Service, Ceredigion County Council
Tony Leahy	Cyngor Sgiliau Sector ar gyfer Gwyddoniaeth, Peirianneg a Thechnolegau Gweithgynhyrchu Sector Skills Council for Science, Engineering and Manufacturing Technologies
Bill Peaper	Cyngor Sgiliau Sector ar gyfer Gwyddoniaeth, Peirianneg a Thechnolegau Gweithgynhyrchu Sector Skills Council for Science, Engineering and Manufacturing Technologies
Arwyn Thomas	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr yr Adran Addysg a Gwasanaethau Cymunedol, Cyngor Sir Ceredigion Assistant Director of Education and Community Service, Ceredigion County Council
Gareth Williams	Cyngor Sgiliau Sector ar gyfer SgiliauAdeiladu Sector Skills Council for ConstructionSkills
Sioned Williams	Cyngor Sgiliau Sector ar gyfer Gofal a Datblygu Sector Skills Council for Care and Development

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Claire Griffiths	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Claire Morris	Clerc Clerk
Anne Thomas	Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 9.30 a.m.
The meeting began at 9.30 a.m.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Christine Chapman:** Good morning and welcome to the Children and Young People Committee. I remind you that all mobile phones, BlackBerrys and pagers should be switched off. We have received no apologies this morning, but I understand that there has been an accident on the M4 near Port Talbot, so there may be some problems as regards the arrival of other witnesses, but we shall see what happens.

9.30 a.m.

Gweithredu Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth
Implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009: Evidence Session

[2] **Christine Chapman:** Today, we are taking evidence from the sector skills councils. I welcome to the meeting Sioned Williams from the Care Council for Wales; Gareth Williams, from ConstructionSkills; and Bill Peaper and Tony Leahy from the Sector Skills Council for Science, Engineering and Manufacturing Technologies. I welcome you all. We have read your paper, so, if you are happy for us to do so, we will go straight into questions.

[3] I will start the questions. We have been looking at the progress of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009. Do you feel that it is helping to achieve parity of esteem between vocational and academic courses? Could you give some evidence on that point? Would anyone like to start?

[4] **Mr Peaper:** From Semta's point of view—and we represent engineering and manufacturing—we see that apprenticeships are now higher on the agenda and there are now more opportunities for young people at the age of 16 to embark on an apprenticeship route. Pathways to Apprenticeships has been a key programme for us. The Welsh baccalaureate and the introduction of principal learning have also provided useful routes into apprenticeships from school for 14 to 16-year-olds. I know that it is only a small pilot project, but from the initial cohort, I think that six centres across Wales are now working on it. So, those are just a couple of points demonstrating the influence it has had.

[5] **Christine Chapman:** Do young people's attitudes towards that seem to be changing?

[6] **Mr Peaper:** Yes, I think so. As an example, in November, Airbus—and I know that Airbus has a significant draw—held an open day for young people and their parents, which attracted more than 5,000 people on that Saturday afternoon. Even for Airbus, that is a significant number of people looking for a career in the sector.

[7] **Christine Chapman:** What about the other sectors?

[8] **Ms Williams:** Bu ichi ofyn a oes gwahaniaeth yn y ffordd y mae pobl yn gweld cymwysterau galwedigaethol a chymwysterau academaidd. Yn y sector gofal, mae'r cymwysterau academaidd yn dueddol o fod yn elfen gul. Hynny yw, gweithwyr cymdeithasol sydd fel arfer â

Ms Williams: You asked if there is a difference in the way that people view vocational qualifications and academic qualifications. In the care sector, the academic qualifications tend to be a narrow component. That is, it is social workers who usually have academic qualifications.

chymwysterau academaidd. Fodd bynnag, o edrych i'r dyfodol—a dyma sy'n bwysig i ni fel sector—yr ydym yn ystyried proffesiynoli ein sector ni yn gyfan gwbl. Mae 'Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cynaliadwy i Gymru: Fframwaith Gweithredu' yn sôn am ba mor bwysig y mae'r proffesiynoli hynny, ac mae'n amhosibl pwysleisio digon i bobl ifanc fod modd gweithio mewn gofal a gwaith blynyddoedd cynnar—rydym yn gyfrifol am hynny hefyd—fel gyrfaoedd a bod posibilrwydd cael gyrfa sydd yn arwain at rywbeth academaidd yn y pen draw.

However, looking to the future—and this is what is important to us as a sector—we are considering the possibility of totally professionalising our sector. 'Sustainable Social Services for Wales: A Framework for Action' talks about the importance of that professionalisation, and you cannot emphasise enough to young people that care and early years work, for which we are also responsible, can be looked on as careers and that there is a possibility of having a career that can lead to something academic in the end.

[9] **Mr Williams:** A dilyn ymlaen o'r hyn a ddywedodd Sioned, mae llwyddiannau ac mae sialensiau hefyd. Felly, rydym wedi bod yn mesur ein llwyddiannau. O ran y diwydiant a hyfforddiant, mae nifer dda yn dod i mewn o'r colegau yn enwedig a thrwy brentisiaeth. Y sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd yw bod y diwydiant, fel gofal, ym mynd yn fwy technegol ac mae cyflogwyr yn gofyn am brentisiaeth lefel 3 fel sylfaen. Felly, mewn ffordd, mae gennym lawer yn fwy o bobl yn cymryd diddordeb mewn adeiladwaith. Y cwestiwn yw faint o'r rheini fydd yn cyfateb i'r hyn y bydd cyflogwyr yn gofyn amdano yn y dyfodol.

Mr Williams: To follow on from what Sioned said, there are successes and there are also challenges. So, we have been measuring our successes. In terms of the industry and training, a good number of people are coming in from colleges in particular and through apprenticeships. The current situation is that the industry, like care, is becoming increasingly technical, and employers require a level 3 apprenticeship as a minimum. So, in a way, we have many more people taking an interest in construction. The question is how many of those will fit employers' requirements in the future.

[10] **Keith Davies:** Mae gennyf gwestiwn ychwanegol i Semta. Yn eich papur, rydych yn sôn am gynllun peilot yn sir y Fflint lle mae 15 o bobl ifanc yn gwneud prif ddysgu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n glir yn eich tystiolaeth ai disgyblion ysgol ydynt, ai disgyblion ysgol yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 ydynt, neu a ydynt mewn rhwydwaith yn y chweched dosbarth. Nid wyf yn gallu bod yn siŵr am hynny o ddarllen eich papur.

Keith Davies: I have a supplementary question for Semta. In your paper, you mention a pilot scheme in Flintshire where 15 young people have are doing principal learning. However, it is not clear in your evidence whether they are school pupils, whether they are school pupils in key stage 4 or whether they are in a sixth form network. I am not sure about that from your paper.

[11] **Mr Peaper:** They are school students who spend some of their time in school and some in college.

[12] **Keith Davies:** A ydynt yng nghyfnod allweddol 4?

Keith Davies: Are they in key stage 4?

[13] **Mr Peaper:** Yes, they are in key stage 4; sorry.

[14] **Keith Davies:** Mae ysgolion wedi bod yn cwyno bod y prif ddysgu yn cymryd gormod o amser oherwydd ei fod yn cystadlu gyda sawl pwnc TGAU, ond mae'n debyg bod y cynllun hwn yn llwyddiannus. A allwch chi roi rheswm pam mae'r cynllun

Keith Davies: Schools have been complaining that the principal learning is taking too much time, because it is in competition with several GCSE subjects, but it appears that this scheme is successful. Can you give us a reason as to why this is so

mor llwyddiannus yn sir y Fflint? successful in Flintshire?

[15] **Mr Peaper:** It is successful because there is a good relationship between the school and the college. The college facilities are very good and, in Flintshire, engineering and manufacturing cater for quite a large number of employees in that area.

[16] **Jenny Rathbone:** What the Welsh economy needs is a sea change in the emphasis on engineering and, from that, manufacturing. How is this skill contributing so far to achieving that sea change?

[17] **Mr Peaper:** The agenda for engineering and manufacturing has grown over the last few years. The other thing to point out is that the sector requires highly educated as well as highly skilled people. The principal learning programmes all the way through to the higher engineering apprenticeship, which will come on stream this year, give us progression routes for young people. Whether they do the principal learning, GCSEs or stay on and do A-levels, there are entry points all the way along that path. We have drawn up a pathway to show how people can step in and step out of those routes, so if they make a decision at the age of 14 to focus on A-levels after they have done their GCSEs, it does not rule them out from getting an apprenticeship. Equally, if a young person decides to take one of the more vocational routes, that does not rule them out from higher education, because they could do an apprenticeship and, quite often, a company will support that young person in taking a degree as part of their training. That is a really important area, and we, as a sector skills council, are certainly flagging that up, and we intend to do more of that by working with Careers Wales.

[18] Also, there is the apprenticeship matching service. In April last year, just as the apprentice matching service was coming on board, we noted that there was a great opportunity to promote engineering and manufacturing as a career through that medium. I think that many parents will also be looking at that matching service when they sit down with their children to help them with their career planning. So, what we have done, as part of the principal learning programme, going forward over the next seven or eight months, is to ensure that those young people who are currently engaged in principal learning register with the matching service as well and ensure that our employers are registering the fact that they require apprentices, so that they do not perhaps leave it completely to the colleges and training providers to use those media as well.

[19] **Jenny Rathbone:** So, it is too soon to say that there has been a sea change.

[20] **Mr Peaper:** It is too soon; yes.

[21] **Aled Roberts:** Gan ddychwelyd at sir y Fflint, a yw'n gywir dweud bod y cwrs hwn wedi datblygu yno oherwydd y berthynas gref rhwng Airbus a Choleg Glannau Dyfrdwy yn hytrach na'r Mesur a'r rhwydwaith 14-19?

Aled Roberts: Returning to Flintshire, would it be true to say that that course has developed there because of the strong relationship between Airbus and Deeside College rather than the Measure and the 14-19 network?

[22] **Mr Leahy:** Obviously, Airbus is the biggest employer in that area, but the progression routes do not involve Airbus alone. Other companies in that neck of the woods are also actively involved. There is UPM Shotton, and JCB is getting involved. So, even though Airbus is useful for the network, because the schools are strongly directed by the fact that there are work opportunities with a big organisation, we are finding that it is not just that organisation. The 15 who have gone through have already been contacted by somewhere in the region of 10 to 15 companies.

[23] **Aled Roberts:** Wrth sôn am y pum

Aled Roberts: You mentioned the five

ardal ychwanegol—sir Gâr, Wrecsam, Gwent, Caerdydd a Chastell-nedd—ai yr un math o gynllun sydd yn yr ardaloedd hynny, neu a ydych yn sôn am gynllun gwahanol yno? Faint o bobl ifanc a fydd yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllun yn yr ardaloedd ychwanegol?

additional areas of Carmarthenshire, Wrexham, Gwent, Cardiff and Neath—would it be the same kind of scheme in those areas, or are you talking about a different scheme there? How many young people would participate in the scheme in the additional areas?

[24] **Mr Leahy:** The numbers are similar. There is one cohort in each network. The key thing about driving forward something that works is that we have the Flintshire network involved in setting up a number of delivery seminars to advertise exactly what it is doing. We have done that through one-to-one sessions and through the Department for Education and Skills' Welsh baccalaureate principal learning team, and we have also used the ColegauCymru network to advertise what we see as good working practices. So, without delving too deeply into what is actually being done at this moment in time, we expect them to take a very similar format.

[25] There could be one fundamental difference, however. In Flintshire, four local schools got involved immediately. We find that not every school gets involved in the network. You could find that one, two, three or four schools, or even more, are involved in the network—we do not actually know how many are involved in each network at this time.

[26] **Julie Morgan:** What you said was very encouraging, but is there any actual evidence yet of pupils moving between vocational and academic work?

9.45 a.m.

[27] **Mr Leahy:** Yes, because of the structure of what we term 'junior apprenticeships'. With regard to level 2, 3, 4 and 5 apprenticeships—and those are just our terms—we find that all learners can find their own level to start with, and all companies can find the learner's level to finish. If they lead someone up to a level 3 standard, they can say, 'Well, this is your stop-off point; there is no reason why you cannot develop in the future, but this is our need for this moment in time'. As Bill mentioned, those companies will fund future progression—not for everyone, but for smaller numbers. There is a Pascal-triangle-type of delivery here, where they will need 100 level 3s, but they may only need 10 levels 4s; that is what has happened. The key thing that we are seeing is on the advanced or higher apprenticeship programmes; we are now seeing learners who have gone through A-level general education provision picking up three good-grade A-levels who will go direct into a level 4 higher apprenticeship programme. They are being developed not just with the bigger companies, but across the board, to be offered through FE and HE centres.

[28] **Lynne Neagle:** In Torfaen, which I represent, we still have lots of manufacturing companies, and without exception they tell me that they are struggling to recruit locally. I was at a company on Friday that has had applications from India, but cannot get applicants locally. This should be an attractive career for young people in Gwent, but there do not appear to be any links between these big employers, the college and schools. What is happening? How are you driving it forward? You mentioned this project that is coming on stream, but what has been happening to date in Gwent for the situation to be like that? To what extent are you targeting places where there is still a fairly thriving manufacturing industry?

[29] **Mr Peaper:** We have been working closely with Coleg Gwent on the project that is now coming on stream. Coleg Gwent has done quite a lot of work with the local schools, and there is also a private training provider in Cwmbrân with a training centre that is kitted out with quite up-to-date equipment. It offers a good standard of apprenticeship. However, one of the issues is the funding for the work-based learning contracts for apprenticeships; once they

have reached the number of students for their contract, they find it very difficult to take on further apprentices. That could be the cause of some of the issues. Again, we are quite happy to be the go-between for a large company and a college, and see if we can help to resolve some of the issues.

[30] **Lynne Neagle:** Just using Torfaen as an example, who would be responsible for taking a lead on this? The company that I was at on Friday has not had any contact with local schools. Who would be responsible for co-ordinating that at local level?

[31] **Mr Peaper:** I would say Careers Wales.

[32] **Mr Leahy:** It could even be the Welsh baccalaureate principal learning network, which would take a lead from enquiries coming through the stakeholders, such as the local college. I would say that it depends on what level of learning that company is looking for. If that company is looking for recruits who are brand new to that industry, the first contact would definitely be with the local college. They could contact Semta and we could act as mediators; there are no issues with that. The key thing about what has happened in Gwent recently is the success of the pathway to apprenticeship programme. The PTA programme was so successful last year that, out of a cohort of about—I am going by memory—18 or 19, 16 of them gained employment. The request from Coleg Gwent this year, through the Department for Education and Skills apprenticeship unit and through us, because we monitor the requests, was to increase that cohort by threefold. That has been allowed; it has been accepted and funded accordingly by the Welsh Government.

[33] **Jocelyn Davies:** I just want some clarification on that. Is the company expected to be proactive in terms of contacting the college? I am sure that companies would say, 'Hey, look, we're busy enough trying to run a business; we expect the college to be the proactive one as to what skills we need'. I think that you would agree. As you say, this is not something that is specific to Torfaen, or to engineering, I guess.

[34] **Mr Williams:** Ar yr ochr adeiladwaith, mae'n sefyllfa ni yn arbennig; yr ydym yn fwrdd hyfforddi ac yn gyngor sgiliau sector i'r diwydiant adeiladu. Mae gennym dîm sy'n trafod yn benodol gyda chwmnïau adeiladu, ac mae hynny'n gryfder. Gobeithio na fyddai'r un cwmni adeiladu mewn sefyllfa lle nad ydym yn gwybod beth sydd arno'i eisiau ac yn colli'r cyfle i ddod o hyd i bobl ifanc. Efallai fod hynny'n fwlch mewn sectorau eraill.

Mr Williams: On the construction side, our situation is unique; we are a training board and a sector skills council for the construction industry. We have a dedicated team that holds discussions with construction companies, and that is a strength. Hopefully, no building firm would be in a situation where we did not know what it wanted and did not have the opportunity to find young people. That may be a gap in other sectors.

[35] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, are companies expected to be proactive in ensuring that training providers in their area know what they want?

[36] **Christine Chapman:** It seems that improvements are needed in communication. That seems to be an issue here.

[37] **Suzy Davies:** This is a question for all of you. The gentleman at the end has talked quite a lot about principal learning qualifications and pathways to higher education. However, the time to be capturing the imagination of youngsters and inspiring them to take these vocational courses is at the age of 14. What input have you had to help design courses from the age of 14? I am particularly worried because the National Training Federation for Wales told this committee that consultation with the skills sector councils in developing and designing courses has been rather limited. Do you recognise that, and if so, why is that?

[38] **Mr Williams:** Nid wyf yn anghytuno, ond mae'n broses ddwy ffordd. O'n safbwynt ni, o ran cymwysterau ac yn y blaen, byddem yn falch iawn pe bai darparwyr yn dod atom i drafod cymwysterau newydd penodol ar gyfer Cymru. Nid ydym wedi gwrthod ymdrin â nhw; nid oes unrhyw un wedi gofyn y cwestiwn. Mae'r prif ddysgu yn gymhwyster a etifeddwyd o Loegr, a ddarparwyd i bwrpas gwahanol, sef y diploma. Cytunaf ei fod yn rhy fawr; fe'i lluniwyd i bwrpas gwahanol i'r hyn roeddem ni'n ei wneud. O hyn ymlaen, byddai datblygu cymwysterau llai, mwy penodol, yn ddefnyddiol iawn—mae angen y ddeialog honno.

Mr Williams: I would not disagree, but it is a two-way process. From our point of view, in terms of qualifications and so on, we would be pleased if providers came to us to discuss specific new qualifications for Wales. We have not refused to deal with them; no-one has asked the question. Principal learning is a qualification that we inherited from England, which was provided for another purpose, namely the diploma. I agree that it is too big; it was meant for a different purpose to what we were doing. From now on, developing smaller, more specific, qualifications would be very useful—we need that dialogue.

[39] **Suzy Davies:** Principal learning is not always available to the younger people for whom this Measure is designed. If it is delivered through the Welsh baccalaureate, that qualification is not always offered in every school at the age of 14. How do you fill that gap?

[40] **Mr Williams:** Dyna oedd y sefyllfa, ond mae pethau bellach wedi datgymalu, ac mae modd astudio'r prif ddysgu ar wahân. Ar y cychwyn, roedd yn golygu bod ysgolion neu golegau yn gorfod cynnig y ddau gymhwyster ar yr un pryd. Roedd hynny'n beth dewr i'w wneud, ond roedd rhai yn teimlo bod hynny'n ormod ar y pryd. Mae'r sefyllfa wedi newid erbyn hyn ac mae'r fagloriaeth yn fwy cyffredin. Pan gychwynnwyd ar hyn, roedd yn ffactor. Nid yw'n ffactor bellach, ond mae angen gofyn beth yw dyfodol prif ddysgu ar draws Cymru a Lloegr. Nid wyf yn gwybod faint o fywyd sydd ar ôl iddo yn y tymor hir iawn.

Mr Williams: That was the case, but things have now changed, and you can study the principal learning separately. At the outset, it meant that schools or colleges had to offer both qualifications at the same time. It was quite a brave thing to do, but some thought at the time that that was too much. The situation has now changed and the baccalaureate is more common. At the beginning, this was a factor. It is no longer a factor, but we need to ask what future there is for principal learning across England and Wales. I am not sure what lifespan it has in the very long term.

[41] **Ms Williams:** Mae cymhwyster bagloriaeth yn y maes gofal dal yn ei ddyddiau cynnar iawn; rydym yn dal i weithio arno. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n cytuno'n llwyr mai'r amser i ysbrydoli pobl ifanc i symud i unrhyw faes yw yn 14 oed. Nid ydym wedi cael llawer o gyswllt ag ysgolion ynglŷn â beth sy'n cael ei ddysgu a beth yw'r dewisiadau mae pobl yn eu gwneud yn 14 oed. Mae'r gwaith rydym yn ei wneud gyda llysgenhadon gofal ar hyn o bryd yn ceisio effeithio ar hynny drwy gael pobl i fynd i ysgolion i sôn am waith a'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael ym maes gofal.

Ms Williams: A baccalaureate qualification in care is still in its early days; we are still working on it. However, I totally agree that the time to inspire young people to move into any field is when they are 14 years of age. We have not had much contact with schools in terms of what is taught and the choices that pupils make at the age of 14. The work that we are doing with care ambassadors at the moment is trying to address that by getting people to go into schools to talk about work and opportunities available in the care sector.

[42] **Aled Roberts:** Roeddech yn sôn nad oeddech wedi cael cysylltiadau ag ysgolion

Aled Roberts: You mentioned that you had not had any links with individual schools, but

unigol, ond yn hytrach gyda rhwydweithiau. Yr hyn sy'n ein poeni yw bod y rhwydweithiau yn darparu cyrsiau a phethau heb unrhyw ymwybyddiaeth o alwadau'r gwahanol sectorau.

rather with networks. What concerns us is that the networks provide courses and things with no awareness of the demands of the different sectors.

[43] **Ms Williams:** Byddwn yn dweud mai ychydig o gyswllt rydym wedi'i gael â'r rhwydweithiau.

Ms Williams: I would say that our contact with the networks has been minimal.

[44] **Mr Leahy:** I can only state how Semta has been involved. It is involved with the area network development plans, which are sent to Semta, because we have an input on the Welsh baccalaureate principal learning qualification. That is a component that we worked with. So, we are aware of the things that are going on in schools. However, the only way that we can get into schools is by working as a network. That is a stepping point. We are gaining access to schools through that network, but only in terms of the principal learning aspect of it at present. We are aware that schools are developing their own programmes of study under an engineering banner, but we are not totally aware of what those programmes are.

[45] **Suzy Davies:** I will just develop my question further. Would you be pleased to see the skills sector councils having a statutory role in the implementation of this Measure?

[46] **Mr Williams:** Rwy'n meddwl bod hyn yn hanfodol. O'n safbwynt ni, mae gennym lawer i'w gynnig. Mae ein perthynas ag ysgolion yn mynd yn ôl 12 mlynedd cyn dyfodiad y Mesur, ac roeddem yn cynnig cyrsiau galwedigaethol cyn bod hyn yn rhywbeth cenedlaethol. Nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu, ond nid yw wedi gwella. Mae fy nghyswllt ag ysgolion yn dal i fod yn gryf—mor gryf ag y bu erioed. Nid yw'r cyswllt mor gryf â'r partneriaethau. Nid oes deialog glir wedi bod.

Mr Williams: I think that this is crucial. From our point of view, we have a lot to offer. Our relationship with schools goes back 12 years before this Measure was introduced, and we were providing vocational courses before this became a national initiative. The situation has not deteriorated nor has it improved. My links with schools are still strong—as strong as they ever were. The links are not so strong with the partnerships. No clear dialogue has taken place.

[47] **Keith Davies:** Problem i ysgolion yw hon. Mae 14 o feysydd prif ddysgu, ac nid oes un ysgol yng Nghymru yn gallu eu cynnig i gyd, am nifer o resymau. Y rheswm cyntaf yw nad yw rhieni a phlant am ddilyn rhai ohonynt, a'r ail reswm yw nad yw'r staff yn meddu ar y cwmwysterau i'w dysgu. Felly, yr unig ffordd o wneud hyn yw fel rhwydwaith, fel y soniodd rhywun yn gynharach.

Keith Davies: This is a problem for schools. There are 14 principal learning areas, and no school in Wales can offer them all, for various reasons. The first reason is that parents and children do not want to take some of them, and the second reason is that staff do not have the qualifications to teach them. Therefore, the only way of doing this, as someone mentioned earlier, is in a network.

[48] I fynd yn ôl at yr hyn a ddywedodd Gareth, roeddwn i ynghlwm â llwybr dysgu yn ymwneud ag adeiladwaith. Roedd y cwrs adeiladwaith yn dod â chyflogwyr i mewn, ond roedd gofyn i'r plant gael profiad gwaith o 50 diwrnod yng nghyfnod allweddol 4. Nid yw'r plant, na'r rhieni na'r ysgolion eisiau hynny. Mae'r sector wedi bod ynghlwm â'r cymhwyster prif ddysgu ond, fel y dywedodd

To go back to what Gareth said, I was involved with a construction learning pathway. The construction course brought employers in, but the children had to complete 50 days of work experience in key stage 4. Children, parents and schools did not want that. The sector has been involved with the principal learning qualification but, as Gareth said, it is too big for key stage 4. They

Gareth, mae'n rhy fawr i gyfnod allweddol 4. Edrychwyd ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr a chafwyd ymgais i'w drosglwyddo i Gymru, ond mae strwythur cyfnod allweddol 4 yn wahanol iawn yng Nghymru—mae'r strwythur yn well yng Nghymru. Felly, yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud yw edrych eto ar y cymhwyster prif ddysgu i weld a oes modd ei wneud yn llai a galluogi rhagor o ysgolion i'w gynnig. A fyddech yn cytuno?

looked at what is happening in England and tried to bring it to Wales, but the key stage 4 structure is very different in Wales—there is a better structure in Wales. Therefore, what is needed is to revisit the principal learning qualification to see whether it can be made smaller so that more schools can offer it. Would you agree?

[49] **Mr Williams:** Rwy'n cytuno. Mae cyrsiau adeiladwaith TGAU da iawn wedi bod, felly efallai fod hwn yn un cam yn rhy bell. Mae rhieni yn deall TGAU. Mae angen inni edrych ar gynnwys y cymhwyster. Datblygwyd y cymhwyster gan y diwydiant, felly mae'n rhaid ei fod o gwmpas ei le, ond efallai y dylid ei ystyried fel tri TGAU.

Mr Williams: I agree. There have been some very good GCSE courses in construction, so this might be a step too far. Parents understand GCSEs. We need to look at the qualification's content. The qualification was developed by the industry, so it is quite close to the mark, but we should perhaps think of it as three GCSEs.

[50] **Aled Roberts:** Rydym yn edrych ar y Mesur hwn yng Nghymru. A oes gan eich cynghorau chi yng Nghymru lai o ddylanwad na'r cyrff cyfatebol yn Lloegr neu'r Alban?

Aled Roberts: We are looking at this Measure in Wales. Do you have less of an influence in Wales than your colleagues in England or Scotland?

[51] **Mr Peaper:** I think that we have a better relationship with the Welsh Government than, perhaps, my colleagues in England have with the decision makers in London. We are very lucky about that, and, from our point of view, it makes our job a lot easier.

10.00 a.m.

[52] **Aled Roberts:** Roeddwn yn meddwl yn fwy am y berthynas o fewn y rhwydweithiau ar lawr gwlad, yn hytrach na'r berthynas gyda'r Llywodraeth.

Aled Roberts: I was thinking more about the relationship within the partnerships at a grass-roots level, as opposed to the relationship with the Government.

[53] **Mr Williams:** Mae'r sefyllfa'n hollol wahanol. Rydym yn wlad eithaf bach, ac mae pethau yn llawer cymhlethach yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, o'n profiad ni, mae'r berthynas rhwng y rhwydweithiau ar lawr gwlad yma yn agosach o lawer nag ydyw yn Lloegr, oherwydd natur a maint ein poblogaeth.

Mr Williams: The situation is entirely different. We are quite a small country, and things are far more complex in England. However, from our experience, the relationships between the grass-roots networks are far closer than they are in England, because of the nature and size of our population.

[54] **Jenny Rathbone:** I am still struggling to understand why it requires statutory measures to get colleges and skills councils to work closer together. I cannot believe that, despite all of the problems that Keith mentioned about parent choice, staff resistance and so on, schools and colleges do not want to ensure that their young people are well-placed to get into work. That just has to be one of their concerns. So, there seems to be a bit of a disjuncture here in how well we are working, which, in my view, should not need statutory measures. So, looking specifically at one thing, we are about to double the number of children who are going to benefit from Flying Start. Ergo, we are going to need a lot more quality early years workers. You do not have to pick up a newspaper very often to see that social workers are desperately struggling because there is a shortage of people doing the job. So,

how well are the partnerships planning for these entirely obvious gaps in the labour market?

[55] **Ms Williams:** O safbwynt fy ymwybyddiaeth i o ba mor dda y mae'r partneriaethau'n ymwneud â hynny, rwy'n credu bod y cyswllt ychydig yn brin. Rydym ni, fel cyngor sgiliau sector, yn gallu cael dylanwad, a rydym yn gwneud hynny, ond mae'r dylanwad hwnnw'n digwydd yn aml iawn trwy gyswllt gyda'r Llywodraeth, ac mae Dechrau'n Deg yn enghraifft dda iawn o hynny. Rydym yn chwarae rôl ganolog yn hynny ar hyn o bryd, a, thrwy hynny, rydym yn cydweithio'n uniongyrchol gyda cholegau a gweithwyr i sichrau ein bod yn gallu recriwitio'r bobl gywir i'r maes hwnnw.

Ms Williams: In terms of my awareness of how effectively the partnerships deal with that, I would say that engagement is slightly lacking. We, as a sector skills council, can and do have an influence, but that influence very often happens through contact with Government, and Flying Start would be a good example of where that happens. We play a central role in that at present, and, through that, we collaborate directly with colleges and staff to ensure that we can recruit the right people in that area.

[56] Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n ymwneud yn aml â chanfyddiad pobl ynghylch y proffesiwn pan fônt yn 14 oed. Maent yn gofyn amryw o gwestiynau, megis 'Beth mae'r gwaith yn ei olygu?', 'A yw'n waith pwysig sy'n werth ei wneud?' ac 'A yw edrych ar ôl y peth mwyaf gwerthfawr sydd gan rywun yn ei fywyd, sef plentyn, yn waith sydd â statws uchel iddo?'. Teimlaf, felly, fod gennym ni, fel cyngor sgiliau sector, waith i'w wneud o safbwynt pa mor bwysig yr ystyrir gwaith gofalu yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n bwysig o safbwynt demograffeg—sydd wedi cael ei drafod ers blynyddoedd—ac mae'n arbennig o bwysig yn awr yn sgîl y pwyslais a roddir ar waith blynyddoedd cynnar, sydd wedi'i gydnabod gan y Llywodraeth trwy Dechrau'n Deg. Mae hefyd yn bwysig yn y cyd-destun economaidd o gael pobl i weithio. Felly, mae gennym rôl ganolog o ran gwneud y gwaith hynny'n uniongyrchol gyda cholegau, ac rydym yn ceisio gwneud hynny gydag ysgolion hefyd.

However, that very often relates to people's perception of the profession when they are 14. They ask several questions, such as 'What does the work involve?', 'Is it important work that is worth doing?' and 'Would looking after the most important thing that a person has in life, namely a child, be considered a high-calibre job?'. I therefore feel that we, as a sector skills council, have work to do with regard to the esteem placed on this profession for the future. That is important in terms of demographics—which has been spoken about for years—and it is particularly important now given the emphasis on early years work, which has been recognised by the Government through Flying Start. It is also important in the economic context of getting people into work. So, we have a central role with regard to doing that work directly with colleges, and we are also endeavouring to do that with schools.

[57] **Jenny Rathbone:** How well is the planning of the 14-19 provision reflecting the excellent communication that you have with our Government?

[58] **Ms Williams:** Efallai ei fod yn wir dweud, pe bai'r cynllunio yn edrych ddigon i'r dyfodol, y byddai digon o bwysau ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf i sicrhau bod y dyblu hwn yn gallu digwydd. Gallem ofyn a oedd rhyw bwynt pan y gallem fod wedi siarad gyda'r partneriaethau ynghynt. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod hynny erioed wedi digwydd.

Ms Williams: It may be true to say that if the planning looked further into the future, then there would be enough pressures over the next three years to ensure that this doubling can take place. We could ask the question of whether we could have spoken with the partnerships earlier. However, I do not think that that has ever happened.

[59] **Jocelyn Davies:** As Jenny Rathbone just said, we read about the shortage of social

workers in newspapers all of the time—and I ought to say that my daughter is currently studying for a social work degree. So, can you explain to us, if it is obvious to everyone, how is the offer of the number of places for social workers calculated? It comes down to a question as basic as that, does it not? Does anyone know how that happens?

[60] **Ms Williams:** Mae hyn yn digwydd drwy gydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol a'r wyth coleg sy'n cynnig gwaith cymdeithasol fel gradd. Rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol—yng Nghymru, ac yng Nghymru'n unig—fod y cwrs gradd mewn gwaith cymdeithasol yn cael ei ddarparu gan y sector, sef y cyflogwyr, a'r sefydliadau addysg uwch yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n cael ei wneud drwy drafod ac ystyried faint o weithwyr cymdeithasol y bydd eu hangen i'r dyfodol, gan edrych ar y mannau gwan.

Ms Williams: This happens through collaboration between local authorities and the eight colleges that offer social work as a degree. I am sure you are aware that—in Wales, and in Wales alone—the social work degree course is provided by the sector, that is, the employers, and higher education institutions working in partnership. That work is done through discussion and consideration of how many social workers will be needed for the future, having identified any shortages in terms of provision.

[61] Ar hyn o bryd, o'r wybodaeth sydd gennym, nid yw'n amlwg bod prinder, ond mae'n ymddangos bod llawer o bwysau. Daw hynny yn sgîl y ffaith bod nifer o bobl yn mynd i mewn i waith cymdeithasol yn ifanc ac yn ddibrofiad ac, efallai, fod y bobl sydd â phrofiad yn gadael. Felly, mae nifer o bobl ifanc yn gweithio mewn sefyllfaoedd sy'n anodd iawn ac yn llawn pwysau. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud gwaith ar hyn o bryd o ran gweithwyr cymdeithasol ymgynghorol. Mae'n edrych ar brosiectau peilot, ac ati, ac yn ystyried darparu 'grisiau' gyrfa gwahanol i weithwyr cymdeithasol. Y gobaith yw y bydd hyn yn cadw pobl yn ymarfer yn y maes yn hirach, oherwydd, yn draddodiadol, mae gweithwyr cymdeithasol—ac roeddwn i yn un fy hun—yn symud i fyny ac yn symud i mewn i reolaeth, nid i mewn i ymarfer mwy dwys.

Currently, from the information we have, it is not clear that there is a shortage, but it seems that there is a lot of pressure. That stems from the fact that many people go into social work when they are young and inexperienced and, perhaps, the people with experience leave. Therefore, a number of young people are working in situations that are very difficult and stressful. Of course, the Government is currently undertaking work on consultant social workers. It is looking at pilot projects, and so on, and is looking to provide different stages in the career progression of social workers. It is hoped that this will keep people practising in the field longer, because, traditionally, social workers—and I was one myself—move up and move into management, not into more intensive practice.

[62] **Aled Roberts:** Os nad oes prinder gweithwyr cymdeithasol, pam mae cynghorau yn y gogledd wedi gorfod recriwtio o'r Almaen, Hwngari a De Affrica?

Aled Roberts: If there is no shortage of social workers, why have councils in the north had to recruit from Germany, Hungary and South Africa?

[63] **Ms Williams:** Nid wyf yn gwybod yr ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw brinder enfawr ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r wybodaeth sydd gennym yn dangos bod ein colegau yn hyfforddi yn ddigonol, o ran rhifau, ar gyfer beth sydd ei hangen. Efallai eu bod yn recriwtio gweithwyr cymdeithasol mwy profiadol sydd wedi bod yn y maes am gyfnod hir.

Ms Williams: I do not know the answer to that question. I am not aware that there is a great shortage at the moment. The information that we have shows that our colleges are training sufficient numbers to meet the need. Perhaps they have recruited more experienced social workers who have a worked in the field for a long time.

[64] **Aled Roberts:** Rwyf yn cyd-weld â Jocelyn. A oes perygl ein bod yn edrych ar Gymru fel uned, heb ystyried y ffaith bod rhai gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn symud i Loegr, lle mae ambell awdurdod yn cynnig telerau sydd ychydig yn well?

Aled Roberts: I agree with Jocelyn. Is there a danger that you are looking at Wales as a unit, without taking into consideration the fact that some social workers move to England, where some authorities offer terms and conditions that are a little better?

[65] **Ms Williams:** Efallai fod hynny'n wir. Ni allaf ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw yn bendant. Gallaf ddarganfod y wybodaeth gyflawn i'r pwyllgor, pe baech yn dymuno hynny, er mwyn gweld y cefndir. Fodd bynnag, cyn belled ag y gwn i, mae'n ymddangos ein bod yn hyfforddi digon i gwrdd ag anghenion Cymru.

Ms Williams: That may be the case. I cannot provide an unequivocal answer to that question. I can look for the background information for the committee, should you wish to see that. However, as far as I am aware, it appears that we are training sufficient numbers to meet Wales's needs.

[66] **Jocelyn Davies:** I want to focus on social work and make a similar point to that made by Lynne Neagle earlier. There are well-paid jobs available in the economy, but we do not appear to be training young people to take them up. We are hearing that companies and local authorities are recruiting from abroad.

[67] **Aled Roberts:** They have to do so.

[68] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, they have to. Perhaps they are not choosing to do that, but have to. So, there is obviously a mismatch.

[69] **Christine Chapman:** Julie and Jenny would like to ask questions and then I would like to move on.

[70] **Julie Morgan:** This seems to be a key point. I had better say at this point that I was a social worker. You said that you would try to give us some written information about this, because there appears to be a gap and it is probably important that, as part of this inquiry, we find out why it is there. You think that enough people are being trained in social work, but there are still gaps in the social work field and some local authorities are struggling. So, we need to try to get an answer to that question.

[71] **Jenny Rathbone:** I would like to broaden the discussion to look at other skills—those of the proverbial Polish bricklayer and plumber. People complain that they cannot get hold of people with these skills. What is it about how we train young people that means that we do not get local people into these skilled and necessary jobs? Is the training that they get at the 14-19 level not appropriate? Does it not give them the skills that they need? What is the reason for this?

[72] **Mr Williams:** Mae dau reswm am hynny. Yn ystod dirwasgiadau'r 1980au a'r 1990au—ac yr ydym yn cael un arall yn awr—nid oedd y bobl fwyaf profiadol yn yr hyfforddiant. Felly, 12 mlynedd yn ôl, roedd hyfforddiant crefftau adeiladu ar ei liniau—roedd yn wan iawn. Felly, rydym yn sôn am y bobl brofiadol hynny—y rhai sydd yn eu 30au sy'n gallu rhedeg safle yn dda. Dyna beth ddigwyddodd yn ystod y degawd diwethaf pan welwyd cynnydd aruthrol, annaturiol ac anghynaliadwy mewn adeiladu.

Mr Williams: There are two reasons for that. During the recessions of the 1980s and 1990s—and we are experiencing another now—the most experienced people were not in the training. Therefore, 12 years ago, construction training was on its knees—it was very weak. So, we are talking about those experienced people—those who are in their 30s and can run a site well. That is what happened at the same time as construction, during the past decade, saw an inordinate surge that was out of the ordinary and

Mae'r rheini'n ffactorau penodol.

unsustainable. Those are specific factors.

[73] Gan edrych i'r dyfodol, mae eich pwynt yn berffaith deg. Mae nifer o bobl ifanc yn astudio ar gyfer cymwysterau mewn colegau, ond nid yw hynny'n eu cymwyso i weithio yn y diwydiant. Mae angen iddynt wneud prentisiaeth ac NVQ, ac felly dim ond nifer benodol o brentisiaethau sydd ar gael. Felly, ni allwn ond dod â hyn a hyn o bobl trwy'r broses. Nid yw pawb yn cwblhau'r cwrs ac nid yw pawb yn dewis aros yn y diwydiant nac o reidrwydd ym Mhrydain i weithio. Mae'n ddiwydiant lle mae sgiliau trosglwyddadwy. Felly, dyna rai o'r ffactorau eraill.

Looking to the future, your point is entirely fair. Many young people study for qualifications in colleges, but that does not qualify them to work in the industry. They need to do an apprenticeship and NVQ and therefore there is only a specific number of apprenticeships available. So, we can only bring so many people through the process. Not everyone completes the course and not everyone chooses to stay in the industry or necessarily to stay in Britain to work. It is an industry where there are transferrable skills. So, those are some other factors.

[74] Mae plymio y tu allan i'n cwmpas, ond rwyf wedi edrych ar hyn. Rwy'n defnyddio'r term 'Powys plumber', ond nid ydynt yn cynnig plymio yng ngholegau Powys am nad oes digon o gyflogwyr i gymryd y prentisiaid hynny ymlaen. Ni allaf gredu nad oes angen plymwyr ar gyfer y dyfodol, pan fydd y criw sy'n gweithio ym Mhowys ar hyn o bryd yn ymddeol. O ble y daw'r bobl hynny? Byddant yn dod o'r tu allan i'r ardal. Felly, cwblhau'r brentisiaeth drwy'r NVQ yw'r sialens, ac, fel y soniais, mae'r niferoedd wedi'u capio. Dim ond nifer benodol y gallwn ei darparu mewn blwyddyn, a rwy'n credu bod hynny'n annigonol. Mae'r sefyllfa yn debyg o ran y ffaith bod mwy o bobl o lawer ar hyn o bryd yn dilyn hyfforddiant llawn amser mewn colegau, sy'n beth da, ond ni fydd llawer o'r rheini'n cwblhau eu hyfforddiant er mwyn bod yn gymwys i weithio yn y diwydiant. Mae sialens arall i ni yn hynny o beth. Felly, mae angen inni sicrhau bod mwy o'r bobl sy'n astudio cyrsiau llawn-amser mewn colegau yn ymgymhwyso'n llawn. Nid oes ateb hawdd i hynny ar hyn o bryd. Mae atebion yn cael eu hystyried o ran strwythur prentisiaethau ac mae angen inni edrych ar hynny oherwydd, hyd yn hyn, nid yw wedi gweithio i nifer fawr o bobl. Bydd yn arwain at brinder arall pan fydd y diwydiant ar i fyny eto.

Plumbing is outside our scope, but I have looked at this. I use the term 'Powys plumber', but they do not offer plumbing in Powys colleges because there are not enough employers to take those apprentices on. I cannot believe that you do not need plumbers for the future, when the crew who are currently working in Powys retire. Where will those people come from? They will come from outside that area. So, the challenge is completing the apprenticeship through the NVQ, and, as I said, the numbers have been capped. We can only provide a certain number per annum, and I am of that the view that that is not sufficient. The situation is similar in that there are far more people currently in full-time training in colleges, which is a good thing, but many of those will never complete their training and become qualified to work in the industry. That is another challenge for us. So, we need to ensure that more of those people who are studying full-time courses in colleges become fully qualified. There is currently no easy solution to that. Solutions are being considered in relation to the structure of apprenticeships, and we need to look at that because, to date, it has not worked for many. That will lead to another shortage when the industry is on the up again.

[75] O'r ochr broffesiynol, mae pobl yn edrych i Seland Newydd ac Awstralia er mwy dod o hyd i waith. Bydd ein graddedigion gorau yn gadael Cymru, os nad Prydain, a gweithio dramor gan nad oes

From a professional point of view, people are looking to New Zealand and Australia in order to find employment. Our best graduates will leave Wales, if not Britain, and will work abroad because there is no work here and

unrhyw waith yma, tra bod cynigion atyniadol i'w harwain dramor. Y cwestiwn yw: a fyddant yn dychwelyd?

there are attractive propositions to lead them abroad. The question is: will they return?

[76] **Jenny Rathbone:** Work does exist here because that is why Polish people are coming over to do it. You are bound to get wastage—some people find that they do not want to do the job or that they are not suitable for it. So, why are we not increasing the numbers to ensure that we are meeting the demand?

[77] **Mr Williams:** Byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai'r ochr brentisiaeth yn gofyn am nifer fwy o gyflogwyr. Byddai hynny i'w groesawu. Mae'r ffaith bod nifer o brosiectau ar gael—ac yr ydym wedi crybwyll y *pathways*—yn ddefnyddiol, ond mae angen i chi sicrhau bod nifer ddigonol o gyflogwyr i gymryd y bobl ifanc ymlaen fel eu bod yn cael y profiad. Mae ansawdd y profiad hwnnw'n bwysig, yn ogystal â hyfforddiant da mewn colegau. Mae prosiectau llwyddiannus wedi cael eu sefydlu. Er enghraifft, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae'r rhaglen prentisiaeth a rennir yn golygu bod nifer o gwmnïau llai yn gallu cymryd prentisiaethau ymlaen. Cryfder hynny yw ansawdd ac amrywiaeth y profiad. Os yw cyflogwr yn mynd i'r wal, nid yw'r prentis yn colli ei swydd. Mae hynny'n cael ei ystyried yng ngogledd Cymru yn awr. Felly, mae ffyrdd newydd ymlaen er mwyn sicrhau bod y bobl sy'n dilyn hyfforddiant llawn amser—ac mae miloedd lawer ohonynt yng Nghymru—yn gallu cwblhau eu hyfforddiant, cael eu hystyried yn gymwys a dod i mewn i'r diwydiant, yn hytrach na gorffen eu hyfforddiant ar ôl dwy flynedd a methu â dod o hyd i waith.

Mr Williams: That would mean that the apprenticeship side would require a greater number of employers. That would be welcome. The fact that there are a number of projects—and we have mentioned the pathways—is useful, but you need to ensure that there are an adequate number of employers to take these young people on so that they get the experience. The quality of that experience is important, alongside the provision of good training in colleges. Successful projects have been established. For example, in Carmarthenshire, the shared apprenticeship programme means that many smaller companies can take on apprenticeships. The strength of that is the quality and variety of experience. If an employer goes bust, the apprentice does not then lose their job. That is currently being looked at in north Wales. So, there are new ways forward to ensure that the people undertaking this full-time training—and there are many thousands of them in Wales—can complete their training, be considered to be properly qualified and be able to enter the industry, rather than completing their training after two years and failing to find work.

[78] **Christine Chapman:** We are running out of time, but there are a couple of Members who want to ask questions. Please be brief.

[79] **Jocelyn Davies:** I do not see why an apprenticeship has to be with only one company. Is it possible—and a 'yes' or 'no' answer will suit me—for someone to do their apprenticeship with more than one company so that several companies share the apprentice?

10.15 a.m.

[80] **Mr Peaper:** It is possible. We have been running a shared apprenticeship pilot scheme, which comes to an end in September and which has been very successful.

[81] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay, that is all I needed to know.

[82] **Mr Williams:** Fel rwyf newydd esbonio, mae'n un o'r projectau llwyddiannus sydd wedi cael ei redeg yng Nghymru. Mae

Mr Williams: As I have just explained, it is one of the successful projects that have been run in Wales. England is now looking at it, so

Lloegr yn edrych arno bellach, felly mae'n dysgu oddi wrth ein llwyddiannau. Mae'n anorfod. Mae'n rhywbeth amlwg i'w wneud, ac mae wedi profi'n llwyddiannus.

it is learning from our successes. It is inevitable. It is an obvious thing to do, and it is successful.

[83] **Aled Roberts:** Roeddech yn sôn nad oedd darpariaeth prentisiaethau plymio ym Mhowys achos nad yw'r galw'n ddigonol. A yw'r ddarpariaeth yn cael ei mesur yn lleol ym mhob man? A oes perygl fod ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru lle mae darparwyr lleol yn dweud nad oes digon o alw, ond nad ydym yn edrych ar y sefyllfa yn genedlaethol? Er enghraifft, gallem ddweud bydd yn rhaid i rywun ym Mhowys sydd â diddordeb mewn plymio fynd i Wrecsam neu Lannau Dyfrdwy er mwyn cael prentisiaeth. Fodd bynnag, os nad ydym yn ystyried y sefyllfa yn genedlaethol, gallai Wrecsam ddweud, 'Dim ond 20 o blymwyr yr ydym eu hangen', ac ni fydd yn cymryd y galw ym Mhowys i ystyriaeth.

Aled Roberts: You mentioned that there is no provision of plumbing apprenticeships in Powys because of insufficient demand. Is the provision measured locally everywhere? Is there a danger that there are rural areas in Wales where local providers say that there insufficient demand, but that we are not looking at the situation nationally? For example, we could say that someone in Powys with an interest in plumbing for an Wrexham or Deeside to have an apprenticeship. However, if we are not looking at the situation nationally, Wrexham could say, 'We only need 20 plumbers', and it would not take the demand in Powys into consideration.

[84] **Mr Williams:** Nid oes gennym dystiolaeth fod teithiau felly yn digwydd. Yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yw nad yw'r hyfforddiant yn cael ei darparu ym Mhowys, felly bydd Powys angen plymwyr yn y dyfodol.

Mr Williams: We do not have any evidence that such journeys are happening. What is happening is that the training is not being provided in Powys, so Powys will need plumbers in future.

[85] **Aled Roberts:** A oes ardaloedd gwledig eraill lle nad oes darpariaeth achos bod y galw yn annigonol?

Aled Roberts: Are there other rural areas where there is no provision because of insufficient demand?

[86] **Mr Williams:** Mae'r ddarpariaeth yn tueddu bod yn yr ardaloedd arfordirol.

Mr Williams: The provision tends to be in the coastal areas.

[87] **Keith Davies:** Sut yr ydych yn credu y gallwch gyfrannu yn fwyaf effeithiol i'r rhwydweithiau roeddech yn sôn amdanynt yn gynharach, gan eu bod yn gorfod cyflwyno eu cynlluniau erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf? Mae'r rhwydweithiau i fod yn gweithio ar eu cynlluniau ar gyfer blwyddyn nesaf yn awr. Sut y gallwch gyfrannu'n well atynt?

Keith Davies: How do you believe you can contribute most effectively to the networks that you mentioned earlier, as they will have to present their plans by next year? The networks are meant to be working on their plans for next year now. How can you contribute better to them?

[88] **Mr Williams:** Hoffem deimlo fod lle i gyflogwyr—nid ni yn unig—i gyfrannu. Mae nifer o grwpiau cyflogwyr mawr a bach ar draws Cymru ac mae ganddynt rôl yn y trafodaethau.

Mr Williams: We would like to think that there is room for employers—not only us—to contribute. There are a number of groups of employers across Wales and they have a part to play in the discussions.

[89] **Keith Davies:** Nid yw hynny'n digwydd mewn nifer o ardaloedd. Rwy'n aelod o'r rhwydwaith yn sir Gaerfyrddin, ac

Keith Davies: That does not happen in many areas. I am a member of the network in Carmarthenshire, and we have employers on

mae gennym gyflogwyr ar y rhwydwaith. Mae gennym bentref galwedigaethol y mae'r cyflogwyr wedi talu amdano, ond nid yw hynny'n rhywbeth cyffredin dros Gymru, nag yw?

the network. We have an occupational village, and the employers have paid for it, but that is not common across Wales, is it?

[90] **Mr Williams:** Nid ymhob man.

Mr Williams: Not everywhere.

[91] **Ms Williams:** Byddwn yn cytuno nad yw'r darlun yr un fath ar draws Cymru gyfan.

Ms Williams: I agree that the picture is not the same across Wales.

[92] **Mr Leahy:** It is a great idea to have representation at the area networks' plan development meetings so that the sector skills council can present the view of the industry in the area. To refer back to what we talked about earlier, we have had feedback that the industry is happy with particular courses and delivery. We should be in a position to feed that back to the area networks and to influence schools and colleges in tweaking their provision.

[93] **Keith Davies:** A ddylai hynny ddod yn ôl fan hyn? Cyfrifoldeb pwy yw hyn? Ar y rhwydwaith rwy'n aelod ohono, mae pennaeth y coleg, penaethiaid ysgolion, cadeiryddion llywodraethwyr ysgol a chyflogwyr. Fodd bynnag, efallai mai dewis Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yw hynny. A ddylai'r Llywodraeth ddweud wrth y rhwydweithiau i gyd fod yn rhaid iddynt gael cynrychiolaeth gan gyflogwyr a'r cynghorau sgiliau sector?

Keith Davies: Should that come back here? Whose responsibility is it? On the network of which I am a member, there is the head of the college, headteachers, chairs of school governors and employers. However, that may be Carmarthenshire County Council's choice. Should the Government tell all the networks that they must have representation from employers and the sector skills councils?

[94] **Mr Williams:** Yr unig beth a ddywedaf yw nad yw'n digwydd ar draws Gymru yn yr un ffordd mae'n digwydd yn sir Gâr; nid yw pawb mor oleuedig â chi, efallai. Os yr ydym yn parhau fel yr ydym, byddwn yn parhau fel yr ydym.

Mr Williams: The only thing that I will say is that it does not happen across Wales in the same way that it happens in Carmarthenshire; not everyone is as enlightened as you are, perhaps. If we continue as we are, we will continue as we are.

[95] **Julie Morgan:** I want to ask about gender stereotyping in particular, and whether the wider choice that is available has broken down any of the traditional barriers in terms of the courses that girls and boys follow?

[96] **Ms Williams:** I ateb yn fyr dros gyngor sgiliau sector ar gyfer gofal, mae'r wybodaeth rydym wedi ei chasglu i weld beth yw'r cydbwysedd rhyw o fewn y gwahanol fathau o waith sydd ar gael yn dangos fod 99% o'r gwaith yn cael ei wneud gan ferched gwyn.

Mr Williams: To answer briefly on behalf of the care sector skills council, the information that we have collected to see what the gender balance within the different types of work available is shows that 99% of the work is done by white women.

[97] Fodd bynnag, rydym yn gweithio'n galed i ddenu mwy o ddynion i waith gofal. Mae hynny'n un o'r pethau sy'n ymddangos yn llwyddianus ar hyn o bryd. Mae diddordeb gan bobl—dynion, yn benodol—nad oeddent wedi meddwl erioed y byddai ganddynt ddiddordeb mewn gwneud gwaith gofal.

However, we are working hard to attract more men to care work. That is one of the things that appear to have been successful at the moment. People—men, in particular—who had never thought that they would be interested in care work are showing an interest. It is happening slowly; things are

Mae'n digwydd yn araf bach; mae pethau'n symud ymlaen yn araf. Mae llawer o waith caled yn gorfod cael ei wneud ar recriwtio ac ar statws a gweledigaeth ynglŷn â'r hyn y mae'r sector yn ei wneud sydd yn dda o ran cynyddu nifer y dynion ac ynglŷn â'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud er mwyn denu dynion i'r sector. Pan rydych yn ystyried bod 99% o'r gweithlu yn fenywod, mae'n dasg anodd.

progressing slowly. There is much hard work to be done on recruitment and on status and a vision in relation to what the sector is doing well in terms of increasing the number of men and in relation to what needs to be done to attract men to the sector. When you consider that the workforce is 99% women, it is a difficult task.

[98] **Julie Morgan:** Are men showing more interest in choosing courses? Has there been any development in terms of more young men choosing courses that are traditionally taken by women?

[99] **Ms Williams:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hyn yn digwydd pan maent mewn addysg ffurfiol. Nid yw'r darlun yn glir. Efallai bydd gennym ddarlun gwell erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'n ymddangos bod hyn yn digwydd ar adeg hyfforddi a dysgu yn y gweithle.

Ms Williams: I am not sure that it happens when they are in formal education. The picture is not clear. We may have a clearer picture by next year. It appears that this is happening at the point of training and learning in the workplace.

[100] **Julie Morgan:** What about the other fields?

[101] **Mr Peaper:** In engineering we have seen an increase in females coming into the sector and, as an aside, in November, the Engineering Employers Federation ran an apprentice of the year competition for Wales, which we support. There were a number of females in the finals. That shows that companies are missing a trick. It is an area where we need to do a lot of work with parents to encourage their daughters into the sector. We have to do a lot more to promote their successes and to get role models on board. Over the next two months we will be running workshops for female apprentices throughout Wales to help them with their career planning and that sort of thing.

[102] **Julie Morgan:** Are the barriers really breaking down? Or are there just isolated examples of women engineers?

[103] **Mr Peaper:** I think that they are isolated examples, to be honest. We need to do a lot more work on this.

[104] **Julie Morgan:** Have you seen any change since this Measure was introduced?

[105] **Mr Peaper:** I do not think so, no.

[106] **Christine Chapman:** I can give you a look at the destination statistics from Careers Wales. Very little has changed over many years. There may be isolated cases, but there is certainly work to be done, as Bill said.

[107] **Aled Roberts:** Beth arall y gall Llywodraeth Cymru neu'r awdurdodau lleol ei wneud i sicrhau bod cyrsiau galwedigaethol yn cael eu haddysgu gan bobl sy'n meddu ar gymwysterau neu brofiad yn y gwahanol sectorau?

Aled Roberts: What more can the Welsh Government or local authorities do to ensure that vocational courses are being taught by people who have qualifications or experience in the different sectors?

[108] **Ms Williams:** Mae'r cwestiwn yn

Ms Williams: That is a very pertinent

berthnasol iawn i'n sector, yn enwedig o ran y cyfnod pan fydd pobl yn astudio ar gyfer TGAU, er enghraifft, neu lefel A. Mewn ysgolion, yn arbennig, athrawon â chefndir mewn meysydd eraill sy'n aml yn addysgu cyrsiau gofal, gan nad oes unrhyw le i fynd i ddysgu fod yn athro ar y pwnc. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r ateb o ran beth fyddai Llywodraeth Cymru'n gallu ei wneud. Nid oes ateb gennyf ar beth ddylid ei wneud, ond rwy'n ymwybodol ei bod yn bwysig i'n sector bod gan bobl ymwybyddiaeth o leiaf o sut mae pethau ar hyn o bryd yn y byd go-iawn. Mae angen pobl sydd â phrofiad o'r maes neu wybodaeth benodol yn y maes. Efallai ei fod mor syml â sicrhau bod yr athrawon hynny yn cael cyfle i fynd allan a gweithio gyda gweithwyr cymdeithasol am fis neu ddau. Mae'n swnio ychydig yn freuddwydiol efallai, ond gall fod yn rhywbeth mor syml â hynny, fel eu bod yn gwybod beth yw realiti gofal, neu o weithio yn y maes gofal preswyl, er enghraifft. Byddai'n rhoi, o leiaf, rhyw fath o arbenigedd iddynt.

question for our sector, particularly in relation to the period when people are studying for GCSEs, for example, or A-levels. In schools in particular, teachers who have a background in other areas often teach care courses, because there is nowhere to go to train to be a teacher in the subject. I am not sure what the answer is in terms of what the Welsh Government could do. I do not have an answer as to what it should do, but I am aware that it is important for our sector that people should at least have an awareness of how things are at the moment in the real world. You need people with experience in the field or specific information about the field. Perhaps it is as simple as ensuring that those teachers have an opportunity to go out and work with social workers for a month or two. That sounds as if I am living in a dream world, perhaps, but it may be that simple, so that they know what the reality of care is, or what it is like to work in residential care, for example. It would, at least, give them some expertise.

[109] **Mr Williams:** O'n hochr ni mae tair elfen. Mae addysg ôl-16, sef y darlithwyr, yr athrawon sy'n addysgu plant 14 i 16 oed yn yr ysgolion, ac mae gennym hefyd ddarpariaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn y ddwy sector. Felly, os ydych yn sôn am gymhwysedd ac a yw'r person yn medru addysgu yn gywir, rwyf yn cytuno â Sioned. O ran darlithwyr, mae'n bwysig bod datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus ac nad yw rhywun oedd wedi gweithio yn y diwydiant 10 mlynedd yn ôl yn meddwl ei fod yn dal yr un peth ag yr oedd. Mae angen datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus. Rwyf yn siŵr bod y colegau gorau yn gwneud hynny—mae enghreifftiau da iawn. Rhaid sicrhau cysondeb o ran hynny a sicrhau bod Estyn yn edrych ar y peth i sichrau bod y wybodaeth yn ddiweddar ac yn gywir.

Mr Williams: From our perspective there are three elements. We have post-16 education, that is, the lecturers, the teachers of 14 to 16-year-olds in schools, and also Welsh-medium provision in both sectors. So, if you are talking about competence and whether someone can teach correctly, I agree with Sioned. In terms of lecturers, it is important that there is continuing professional development and that someone who worked in the industry 10 years ago does not think that it has stayed the same as it was. There is a need for continuing professional development. I am sure that the best colleges do that—there are very good examples. We need to ensure consistency in that regard and to ensure that Estyn looks at that to ensure that the information is accurate and up-to-date.

[110] Ynghylch yr ysgolion, yn yr un modd, mae trosglwyddo'n sialens. Er bod gweithio mewn rhwydwaith yn wych, mae gweld y plant hyn yn cael eu bysio ar draws gwlad yn bryder, fel y mae sut i sicrhau'r athrawon. Mewn byd perffaith, byddant yn cael secondiad chwe mis i sicrhau eu bod yn datblygu, ond nid yw hynny'n mynd i ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen sicrhau

In terms of the schools, in the same way, it is a challenge to transfer. Although working in a network is excellent, seeing these children being bussed across rural areas is a worry, as is how to get the teachers. In a perfect world, they would have a six-month secondment to ensure their development, but that is not going to happen. However, we need to ensure that at least an element of experience and

bod o leiaf elfen o hyfforddiant a phrofiad i bobl sy'n addysgu pynciau galwedigaethol mewn ysgolion, a bod y lefel honno'n digwydd bob tro. Ar draws y sector addysg Gymraeg, mae'r ddau sefyllfa'n codi. Mae hynny'n gymhleth. Nid wn os yw'n dod mewn i sgôp trafodaethau heddiw, ond un cwestiwn yw: a ydych yn datblygu'r galw yn gyntaf ac wedyn gwneud y ddarpariaeth, neu a ydych yn gwneud y ddarpariaeth yn gyntaf ac wedyn bydd y galw yn ddilyn?

training is available to those who teach vocational courses in schools, and that that level is achieved at all times. Across the Welsh-medium sector, the two situations arise. That is complex. I do not know whether it falls within the scope of today's discussions, but one question is: do you develop the demand first and then make the provision, or do you make the provision first and then the demand follows?

[111] **Mr Peaper:** In our sector, there are some good examples of development for teaching staff. Just recently, we organised an introduction to composite materials for lecturers across Wales. We did the same for photonics and the new technologies, which is a real issue in our sector because technology moves so quickly. Also, there is the work that ESW has done across Wales for computer numerical control type training for machining. So, there are some very good examples of development work, but there are issues around providing cover while teachers are away from the classroom, and also around ensuring that the programmes are accessible. For instance, with regard to the introduction to composites, we were able to take advantage of the composite centre in north Wales, and we are looking to organise something with its composite centre at Pembrokeshire College. However, travelling is quite difficult when you just have a couple of day programmes.

[112] **Keith Davies:** Rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, daeth adroddiad Taylor allan, a argymhellodd ein bod ni'n rhyddhau athrawon am dymor bob pum mlynedd, ac am flwyddyn bob saith mlynedd. Ni chawn hynny, ond a ydych yn credu y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru gael rhyw fath o system felly? Derbyniaf ei bod yn anodd yn ystod y flwyddyn ysgol, ond unwaith bod mis Mehefin a Gorffennaf yn dod, a fyddai athrawon yn gallu cael y cyfle i fynd allan i'r gweithle am fis neu chwe wythnos er mwyn hogi'u sgiliau? A ddylem argymhell hynny i'r Llywodraeth?

Keith Davies: Some years ago, the Taylor report came out, which recommended that we release teachers for a term every five years and for a year every seven years. We will not get that, but do you think that the Welsh Government should have some sort of system like that? I accept that it is difficult during the school year, but once June and July comes could teachers perhaps have the opportunity to go out of the workplace for a month or six weeks to hone their skills? Should we recommend that to the Government?

[113] **Mr Williams:** Mae'n syniad da, ac efallai bod hynny'n mynd â ni yn ôl i'r dyddiau gwell pan oedd gennym y cynlluniau UBI—Understanding British Industry—pan oedd athrawon yn cael blwyddyn o'r ysgol. Ni wn pam oeddent eisiau blwyddyn; ni fyddent byth yn mynd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, heblaw eu bod nhw'n dysgu cymhwyster galwedigaethol, dylid sicrhau o leiaf wythnos o hyfforddiant strwythuredig neu rywbeth realistig, ond nid yw cael dim yn dderbyniol.

Mr Williams: It is a good idea, and perhaps that would take us back to better days when we had the UBI—Understanding British Industry—schemes when teachers had a year out of school. I do not know why they wanted a year; they might never go back. Unless they teach a vocational qualification, I would say that there should be at least a week of structured training, or something realistic, but having nothing is not acceptable.

[114] **Ms Williams:** Rwyf hefyd yn meddwl y byddai'n grêt pe bai rywfaint o hynny yn gallu digwydd yn ein sector ni. Mae'n bwysig dweud hynny. Rwyf yn

Ms Williams: I also think it would be great if some of that could happen in our sector. It is important to say that. I am listening to my colleagues here talk about technological

gwrando ar fy nghyfeillion yma yn siarad am bethau technolegol; mae technoleg yn dod mewn i'n sector ni yn araf. Fodd bynnag, mae pawb yn arbenigwyr ar ofal—mae pawb yn gwybod sut i'w wneud. Mae canfyddiad felly yn bod, p'un a ydym yn hoffi cydnabod hynny ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n wir—ni all pawb wneud y gwaith, a byddai'n fantais fawr pe bai athrawon yn cael profiad o fod yno a gweld sut mae pethau. Nid dim ond gwybodaeth yw gofal; mae'n ymwneud â sgiliau penodol hefyd.

things; technology is gradually entering our sector. However, everyone is an expert on care—everyone knows how to do it. There is such a perception out there, whether we like to acknowledge it or not. However, it is not true—not everyone can do it, and it would be a big plus if teachers gained experience of being there and seeing how it is. Care is not only information; it is also to do with specific skills.

10.30 a.m.

[115] **Mr Leahy:** Coming from an FE background and dealing with teachers and FE lecturers, there was always a scheme where teachers could come into colleges over the summer and gain work experience, as you mentioned before. It is not true work experience—it is simulated work experience, but the FE centres of Wales should be taken advantage of. They have fantastic resources and they can mimic the needs of teachers because they support industry in a true work environment.

[116] There are two ways to do that. First, the networks that I deal with see teachers going into and working in the FE sector, and vice versa so that lecturers go into schools to teach a cohort of learners from a number of different schools. I do not think that teachers will be allowed to do this for six months every three years—the difficulty is maintaining that expertise in the classroom, which is what the learner wants. However, there is a way of doing that during a summer secondment or summer vacation, for example, which could be provided. There will be a knock-on effect on day-to-day activity if you are part of a network that includes schools, FE and HE colleges.

[117] **Christine Chapman:** Time is running out, so we will have to bring this session to a close. Thank you very much for attending. We wanted to raise a few other issues with you, so I will send on the questions to you so that you can respond in writing. You will be sent a transcript of the meeting to check for factual accuracy. Thank you very much.

[118] The committee will now take a short break and we will reconvene at about 10.45 a.m.

Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10.33 a.m. a 10.46 a.m.
The meeting was adjourned between 10.33 a.m. and 10.46 a.m.

[119] **Christine Chapman:** I welcome you back to the meeting. We will continue with the inquiry into the implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009. We are now going to take evidence from Ceredigion County Council. I welcome to the meeting Eifion Evans, the council's director of education and community service, and Arwyn Thomas, who is the assistant director of education and community service. Thank you both for attending. You have submitted a paper in advance, which Members will have read. If you are happy we will start off with questions.

[120] **Mr Evans.** Yes.

[121] **Christine Chapman:** I want to start with a general question. How are you ensuring an improved choice of courses for learners?

[122] **Mr Evans:** I will start the ball rolling.

[123] Dechreuaf drwy roi esboniad o'r hyn rydym yn ei wneud. Yn gyntaf, cyn belled ag y mae'r Mesur yn y cwestiwn, yn sicr, o'n safbwynt ni yng Ngheredigion, rydym yn ei groesawu'n fawr oherwydd mae'n rhoi cyfleoedd ehangach i'n disgyblion ddewis pynciau sy'n berthnasol ac yn briodol ar gyfer eu hanghenion nhw. Un o'r heriau mwyaf sydd gennym mewn ardal wledig fel Ceredigion yw diffyg rhychwant o ddarparwyr priodol ar gyfer cynnal y cyrsiau hyn. Felly, mae'r pwysau'n cwympo'n fwyfwy sgwâr ar ysgwyddau'r ysgolion i gyflawni gofynion y Mesur. Mae hyn yn golygu bod nifer o'n hysgolion, hyd yma, wedi bod yn cyflogi mwy o staff er mwyn cynnig y ddarpariaeth hon ymhob un o'n sefydliadau fel ag y maent. Nid yw hyn yn gynaliadwy yn yr hirdymor; ni allwn barhau fel hyn.

I will start by giving an explanation of what we do. First of all, as far as the Measure is concerned, certainly, from our point of view in Ceredigion, we warmly welcome its introduction because it provides broader opportunities for pupils to choose subjects that are relevant and suit their own needs. One of the greatest challenges that we have in a rural area such as Ceredigion is that we do not have an adequate range of appropriate providers to run these courses. Therefore, the pressure falls squarely on the schools' shoulders to achieve the requirements of the Measure. This means that a number of our schools, to date, have been employing more staff in order to provide this provision in each one of our institutions as they stand. This is not sustainable in the long term; we cannot continue like this.

[124] Yn y papur, rydym yn sôn am y ffaith ein bod wedi dechrau datblygu model *hub and spoke*. Nid wyf yn gwybod sut i gyfieithu'r term i'r Gymraeg; rydym wedi ceisio bathu ambell derm, ond nid yw'n llithro'n rhwydd oddi ar y dafod, felly, *hub and spoke* fydd y model. Beth rydym yn ei olygu wrth hyn yw y bydd un sefydliad yn gyfrifol am y ddarpariaeth ôl-16. Yn y *spoke*, byddant yn darparu trawsdoriad o bynciau sy'n cwrdd â gofynion y disgyblion ar y safle hwnnw. Er enghraifft, os edrychwn ar gyfuniad o dair ysgol, bydd yr *hub* yn darparu 20 cwrs, a'r *spoke* wedyn yn cynnig 10 ar y ddau safle arall.

In the paper, you will see that we have started to develop a hub-and-spoke model. I do not know how to translate that into Welsh; we have tried to come up with a term, but it does not trip easily off the tongue, so we have stuck with the hub-and-spoke model. What we mean by that is that one institution will be responsible for the post-16 provision. In the spoke, they will provide a range of subjects to meet the demands of the pupils on that site. For example, if we look at a combination of three schools, the hub will provide 20 courses, and the spoke will provide 10 on the two other sites.

[125] Yn gryno, rydym yn croesawu'r Mesur yn fawr ac rydym yn cwrdd â gofynion y Mesur drwy roi system o'i bath yn ei lle. Rwyf yn credu mai un o'r problemau cuddiedig o safbwynt cefn gwlad Cymru yw cost trafnidiaeth. Nid oes ots beth a wnawn yng Ngheredigion, oherwydd bydd cost gudd trafnidiaeth wastad yno. Hyd yn oed gyda'r model *hub and spoke* hwn bydd yn rhaid i naill ai staff neu blant symud, ac, yn wahanol i'r ardaloedd mwy poblog, bydd yn rhaid i bobl deithio cryn bellter. Rydym yn sôn am 12 i 15 milltir rhwng sefydliadau, ac nid ydym yn siarad am yr heolydd gorau yn y byd. Os ydych wedi teithio rhwng Tregaron ac Aberystwyth neu rhwng Llanbedr Pont Steffan a Thregaron, byddwch

Briefly, we warmly welcome the Measure and we are meeting its requirements by putting this system in place. I believe that one of the hidden problems in relation to rural Wales is transport costs. It does not matter what we do in Ceredigion, because the hidden cost of transport will always be there. Even with this hub-and-spoke model, staff or pupils will have to travel, and, unlike the more highly populated areas, it means travelling some distance. We are talking about 12 to 15 miles between institutions, and we are not talking about the best roads in the world. If you have travelled between Tregaron and Aberystwyth or between Lampeter and Tregaron, you will know what I am talking about.

yn deall yr hyn rwyf yn sôn amdano.

[126] **Mr Thomas:** Maent yn well na'r M4.

Mr Thomas: They are better than the M4.

[127] **Mr Evans:** Ydynt, maent yn well na'r M4 y bore yma. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mr Evans: Yes, they are better than the M4 this morning. [*Laughter.*]

[128] Mae'n gost gudd, ac rydym wedi nodi y bydd 40% o gyllid y prosiect datblygu rhwydwaith ffyrdd eleni yn mynd i dalu am gostau trafnidiaeth yn unig; nid ar gyfer sefydlu cyrsiau newydd na chyflogi staff newydd, ond i hyrwyddo'r model rydym wedi sôn amdano. Arwyn, rwy'n credu dy fod am sôn am gyd-destun y gwaith.

It is a hidden cost, and we have identified that 40% of the road network development project funding will go towards meeting the transport costs alone; not to establish new courses or employ new staff, but to promote the model that we have mentioned. I think that Arwyn wants to talk about the context of this work.

[129] **Mr Thomas:** Gwn eich bod yn canolbwyntio ar y grŵp 14-19, ond un peth rydym wedi bod yn gweithio arno dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf yng Ngheredigion yw sicrhau bod isadeiledd ysgolion yn iawn ar gyfer pawb—i ddisgyblion rhwng tair ac 19 oed. Dim on rhan o'r arlwy a gynigiwn i ddisgyblion yw'r darn 14-19.

Mr Thomas: I know that you focus on the 14-19 group, but one thing that we have been working on over the past few years in Ceredigion is ensuring that the school infrastructure suits everyone—for all pupils between the ages of three and 19. The 14-19 aspect is only one part of the provision on offer to pupils.

[130] Yn draddodiadol, yn enwedig yn yr ysgolion uwchradd llai, caiff cyllidebau eu tynnu o gyfnodau allweddol 3 a 4, yn enwedig cyfnod allweddol 3, er mwyn talu am addysg ôl-16. Er mwyn ichi weld darlun o'r hyn rydym yn ceisio ei wneud, yn 2005, roedd gan Geredigion tua 76 o ysgolion cynradd. Rydym yn rhagweld, erbyn Medi 2012, y bydd nifer yr ysgolion cynradd wedi lleihau i tua 50. Er mwyn newid yr isadeiledd, rydym am greu arbedion gan wneud y system yn fwy effeithiol ac effeithlon drwyddi draw. Bydd modd inni wedyn ehangu'r dewis ôl-14, fel y soniodd Eifion, a chynnig modelau sydd yn ein galluogi i sefydlu arlwy eang sy'n cynnig dewisiadau lleol, gan hefyd ystyried cyfrwng y cyrsiau, boed yn Gymraeg neu yn Saesneg, ar gyfer dysgwyr yng Ngheredigion.

Traditionally, especially within the smaller secondary schools, the budgets of key stages 3 and 4, especially key stage 3, have been drawn upon in order to pay for post-16 education. So that you have a picture of what we are trying to achieve, in 2005, Ceredigion had about 76 primary schools. We anticipate that, by September 2012, the number of primary schools will have reduced to about 50. In order to change the infrastructure, we need to make savings and make the system more effective and efficient as a whole. This will enable us to broaden the post-14 options available, as Eifion mentioned, and offer models that enable us to put a broad menu in place that provides options locally, and which considers the medium through which pupils in Ceredigion take courses, be that Welsh or English.

[131] **Christine Chapman:** I want to bring Simon Thomas in, but I wonder whether you feel that there could be gaps. I know that you have just mentioned some, but are there groups of learners for whom the Measure has not increased the choice of courses?

[132] **Mr Evans:** Mae'n deg dweud mai dim ond ychydig iawn o gyrsiau sy'n berthnasol i'r sefyllfa honno. Mae ysgolion wedi llwyddo i gynnig rhychwant eang o gyrsiau ar draws y sefydliadau. Bydd bylchau

Mr Evans: It is fair to say that very few courses would fall into that category. Schools have succeeded in offering a broad range of courses across the institutions. Gaps will arise where there are inadequate numbers to

yn codi lle mae niferoedd annigonol i redeg y cyrsiau. Er enghraifft, dim ond un disgybl, ac yntau'n byw yng nghanol y sir—sef ardal eang rhwng Tregaron, Llanbedr Pont Steffan, Llandysul ac allan i'r môr yn Aberaeron—sydd wedi dewis astudio'r gyfraith. Ni allwn redeg y cwrs i'r un disgybl hwn yn unig oherwydd byddai'n amhosibl yn ariannol gwneud hynny. Nid oes unrhyw sefydliad arall sy'n ddigon agos i gatref yr unigolyn dan sylw lle gallwn awgrymu ei fod yn teithio iddo er mwyn dilyn y cwrs. Serch hynny, prin iawn yw'r enghreifftiau hynny.

run the courses. For example, only one pupil, who lives in the middle of the county—by which I mean the broad area between Tregaron, Lampeter, Llandysul and out to the coast in Aberaeron—chose to study law. We cannot run the course just for him because it would be financially impossible to do so. There is no other institution close enough to the individual's home that we could suggest he attends to follow the course. However, those examples are very few and far between.

[133] **Mr Thomas:** Yr hyn sydd wedi newid hefyd, fel y dywedodd Eifion, yw'r sefyllfa lle'r oedd ysgolion yn ymgynghori'n llawn gyda'r dysgwyr ymlaen llaw, cyn addasu arlwy'r cwricwlwm bob blwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni dorri'r brethyn yn ôl y gyllideb sydd ar gael; mae hynny'n wir ar gyfer pob sefydliad dan sylw. Dyma lle rydym yn hyrwyddo cydweithio traws-ysgol a thraws-ffiniol er mwyn ehangu'r dewisiadau a'r cyfleoedd i'r disgyblion.

Mr Thomas: What has also changed, as Eifion said, is the fact that schools used to consult fully with learners in advance, so that the curriculum menu could be adapted every year. However, we have to live within our means, in line with the budget available; that is true for every institution in question. This is where we promote cross-school and cross-border collaboration in order to extend the choices and opportunities available to pupils.

[134] **Simon Thomas:** Rwyf am ddechrau drwy ddatgan diddordeb gan fod fy mab newydd ddechrau cwrs ôl-14 yn un o'ch ysgolion. Un pwynt a gododd yn y sesiwn gynharach, pan oeddech yn sownd ar y draffordd, oedd bod problemau wrth ddarparu rhychwant ehangach o gyrsiau mewn ardal megis Powys gan nad oes cyflogwyr ar gael i orffen y brentisiaeth. Roedd modd rhedeg y cyrsiau ond nid oedd lle i ddysgwyr symud ymlaen i brentisiaeth neu orffen y profiad gwaith. Mae diffyg darpariaeth debyg yng Ngheredigion. Mae llawer o fusnesau un person, ond nid oes llawer o gwmnïau sy'n gallu cynnal y math hwnnw o brofiad gwaith. Sut mae goresgyn hynny yng nghyd-destun cefn gwlad?

Simon Thomas: I will start by declaring an interest as my son has just started a post-14 course in one of your schools. One point that came up in the earlier session, when you were stuck on the motorway, was that there were problems in providing a greater range of courses in areas such as Powys because not enough employers were available to take an apprentice. Courses could be run but there was no scope for learners to move on into an apprenticeship or complete the work experience. There is a lack of similar provision in Ceredigion. There are many sole traders, but not many companies able to sustain that sort of work experience. How can you overcome that problem in a rural context?

[135] **Mr Thomas:** Mae hynny'n bryder i mi. Fel y gwelwch o'r wybodaeth a ddarparwyd gennym, gwelwyd cynnydd yn nifer y disgyblion sy'n aros yn yr ysgol ar ôl 16 oed. Mae'r dewisiadau addysg bellach yn gyfyng yn lleol. Byddwn yn dadlau bod y ffordd rydym yn edrych ar y gyfundrefn addysg yn genedlaethol, o ran amddifadedd a thlodi, yn rhy gul. Ceredigion yw'r ail isaf o ran dwysedd poblogaeth—rydym yn

Mr Thomas: That is a cause of concern for me. As you will see from the information that we have provided, there has been an increase in the number of pupils staying on at school post-16. Further education options are limited in the area. I would argue that the way that we look at the education system nationally, in terms of poverty and deprivation, is too narrow. Ceredigion is second from the bottom in terms of population density—we

wasgaredig—ond y canfyddiad o Geredigion yw ei bod yn ardal o *leafy suburbs* lle mae gan bawb bocedi dyfnion a lle mae pawb yn byw yn fras. Ond, yn ôl yr ystadegau, yng Ngheredigion mae'r cyfartaledd cyflog isaf yng Nghymru.

are sparsely populated—but Ceredigion is perceived as being an area of leafy suburbs where people have deep pockets and live well. However, the statistics show that Ceredigion has the lowest average salaries in Wales.

[136] Yr hyn sy'n cuddio tlodi gwledig yw bod nifer o unigolion yn rhedeg eu busnesau eu hunain—maent yn hunangyflogedig. Ceredigion yw'r ail uchaf, yn dilyn Powys, yn hynny o beth. Felly, mae dicotomi a thensiwn yn hynny. O safbwynt addysg ôl-16, y broblem yw bod yr economi'n crebachu, bod llai o waith i bobl sy'n hunangyflogedig, nid ydynt yn cymryd prentisiaid, felly mae llai o opsiynau ar gael. Roeddwn yn ardal y Fflint yn ddiweddar, yn gwrando ar gyhoeddiad bod 500 o brentisiaethau yn cael eu cynnig gan Airbus. Mae hynny'n ysgogiad i bobl—er enghraifft, eich mab sy'n mynd i flwyddyn 10. Os yw'n gweithio'n galed, mae prentisiaeth ar gael yn y pen draw mewn lle penodol gyda chyflog penodol. Mae cymhelliad i wneud yn dda yn yr ysgol—nid yw'n teimlo'i fod yn yr ysgol am nad oes dewis arall ar gael. Felly, mae hynny'n her.

A lot of rural poverty is hidden by the fact that many people run their own businesses—they are self-employed. Ceredigion has the second highest number, following Powys, in that regard. Therefore, there is a dichotomy and tension there. In terms of post-16 education, the problem is that the economy is shrinking, there is less work for the self-employed, they are not taking on apprentices, so there are fewer options available. I was in the Flint area recently, listening to an announcement that 500 apprenticeships are being offered by Airbus. That encourages people—for example, your son, who is going into year 10. If he works hard, there is an apprenticeship available at the end of it, in a specific place and with a specific salary. That encourages him to do well in school—he does not feel that that he is in school because there are no other options available. So, that is a challenge.

[137] Un o'r argymhellion yn ein papur yw bod angen trosolwg economaidd ar y canolbarth yn gyffredinol, er mwyn ceisio denu busnesau hyfyw i roi cyfleoedd i'n pobl ifanc. Rydym yn teimlo ein bod yn eu magu'n dda ac yn eu haddysgu'n dda ac wedyn yn eu hallforio i leoedd eraill.

One of the recommendations made in our paper is the need for an economic overview of mid Wales in general, in order to attract viable businesses to provide opportunities for our young people. We feel that we are nurturing and educating our children well, and then exporting them to other places.

[138] **Mr Evans:** Mae'r pwynt olaf yn un allweddol. Yr hyn sydd wedi bod yn amlwg dros y blynyddoedd yw bod deilliannau dysgwyr Ceredigion—maddeuwch imi am ganu clodydd Ceredigion—yn uchel iawn. Mae hynny'n golygu ein bod yn rhoi sgiliau i bobl ifanc, a'u bod wedyn yn symud i'r dinasoedd mawr er mwyn ennill bywoliaeth sy'n gydnaws â'u cymwysterau. Mae llithriad pobl ifanc allan o'r sir. Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, newidiodd yr ystadegau yn syfrdanol yng Ngheredigion—am y tro cyntaf erioed, roedd mwy o bobl 65 oed a hŷn yn byw yn y sir nag o blant dan 16. Mae'r bwlch yn cynyddu. Mae hynny'n dangos bod pobl yn hapus i ymddeol i'r sir, ond nid yw'n sir sy'n denu pobl i fagu plant. Mae hynny'n anffodus i Geredigion a chefn gwlad Cymru.

Mr Evans: That final point is key. What has been clear over the years is that learner outcomes in Ceredigion—forgive me for singing Ceredigion's praises—are very high. That means that we provide young people with skills and that they then move to the big cities to make a living in line with those qualifications. There is a drain of young people from the county. Two years ago, there was a fundamental change in the statistics — for the first time ever, there were more people aged 65 and over living in the county than children up to the age of 16. The gap is getting bigger. That shows that people are happy to retire to the county, but it is not a county in which people choose to raise their children. That is unfortunate for Ceredigion and for rural Wales.

[139] **Mr Thomas:** Mae'r Mesur wedi caniatáu inni agor y cwricwlwm allan o ran y pynciau galwedigaethol. Byddwn yn dadlau ein bod yn cynnig profiadau a chymwysterau i ddisgyblion, ond nad oes *end game* go iawn iddynt. Pe bawn yn gwybod bod diwydiant yn bodoli yn y pen draw, byddwn yn gwybod pa sgiliau priodol sydd eu hangen er mwyn cael lle yn y diwydiant hwnnw. Mae modd dadlau ein bod yn culhau yn rhy gynnar—rwy'n derbyn hynny—os ydym am sicrhau dilyniant clir, o'r cynradd i'r uwchradd, gyda nod penodol mewn golwg. Rydym yn magu'n pobl ifanc er mwyn iddynt fynd yn ôl i fuddsoddi yn yr ardal leol. Mae lle i ddatblygu yn bendant.

Mr Thomas: The Measure has allowed us to open up the curriculum in terms of vocational subjects. I would argue that we are offering pupils the experiences and qualifications, but that there is no proper end game for them. If I knew that there was an industry there at the end, I would know what skills were needed for that industry. It is possible to argue that we are narrowing things down too early—I accept that—if we want to secure continuity, from the primary to the secondary, with a specific aim in mind. We are raising our children so that they return to invest in the local area. There is definitely room for development.

11.00 a.m.

[140] **Simon Thomas:** Rydych yn sôn am sawl peth yn eich papur. Os ydych yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth, rydych yn gwneud hynny gydag ardaloedd sy'n debyg i Geredigion, o safbwynt y patrwm gwaith a'r economi. Mae rhai o'r pethau rydych wedi sôn amdanynt yn bethau clodwiw, ond nid ydynt yn mynd i ddigwydd dros nos.

Simon Thomas: You mention a number of things in your paper. If you work in partnership, you do so with areas that are similar to Ceredigion, in terms of the economy and the patterns of work. Some of the things that you have mentioned are praiseworthy, but they are not going to happen overnight.

[141] A allwch wneud rhywbeth gyda'r sefyllfa fel ag y mae? Ar ochr mwy positif, mae o leiaf rhyw fath o ddiwylliant yng nghefn gwlad o fynd ar eich liwt eich hun, boed hynny'n fusnes atodol i fusnes fferm neu rhyw fusnes arall. A oes modd cael busnesau un person, neu fusnesau bach, yng nghefn gwlad—nid yng Ngheredigion yn unig—i gydweithio mwy i gynnig rhyw fath o lwyfan profiad gwaith i'n pobl ifanc? Nid ydych yn mynd i gael cwmnïau fel Airbus, ond efallai bod modd i gwmnïau ddod at ei gilydd i gynnig cyfleoedd i bump neu chwech o bobl. A oes modd cael darpariaeth felly?

Is there anything that you can do with the situation as it currently exists? On the more positive side, there is at least some kind of culture in rural areas of working for yourself, whether that is a supplementary business to a farm business or some other business. Is there a way of getting these sole traders, or very small businesses, in rural areas—not just in Ceredigion—to collaborate more to offer some kind of work experience platform for our young people? You are not going to get companies such as Airbus, but companies may be able to come together to offer opportunities for five or six people. Is it possible to get that sort of provision?

[142] **Mr Evans:** Byddem yn dadlau bod hynny yn dechrau ymhell cyn i'r Mesur ddod i rym o ran y ddarpariaeth 14-19. Yn wir, mae'n dechrau ar waelod yr ysgol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y sgiliau sylfaenol yn eu lle—sgiliau sy'n addas ac yn ddigonol i ganiatáu i bobl ddatblygu sgiliau llythrennedd, rhifedd, technoleg gwybodaeth ac entrepreneuriaeth, sy'n elfen bwysig. Mae'n bwysig iddynt feithrin a magu'r sgiliau sylfaenol hyn sy'n

Mr Evans: I would argue that that starts way before the Measure kicks in with regard to the 14-19 provision. Indeed, it starts at the bottom of the school. We must ensure that the basic skills are in place—skills that are appropriate and adequate to allow people to develop literacy, numeracy, information technology and important entrepreneurial skills. It is important for them to nurture the basic skills that will allow them to succeed in

mynd i ganiatáu iddynt lwyddo ym mha bynnag faes y maent yn ei ddewis. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y ddolen gyswllt o'r cyfnod sylfaen hyd ddiwedd y daith gyda'r Mesur yn dynn.

whichever area they choose. We must ensure that that linkage between the foundation phase and the end of the journey with the Measure is robust.

[143] Un fantais enfawr, felly, wrth inni newid ein hisadeiledd addysg o fewn y cyngor sir, yw ein bod yn creu ysgolion sy'n darparu ar gyfer yr ystod oedran 3-19. Rydym yn symud i ffwrdd o'r cysyniad hwn o'r cyfnod sylfaen a chyfnod allweddol 2 a 3—o'r meithrin i flwyddyn 3, wedyn o flwyddyn 3 i flwyddyn 9, ac yna o flwyddyn 9 hyd ddiwedd eich cyfnod yn yr ysgol. Bydd hyn yn cael gwared ar y problemau pontio rhwng cyfnodau. Bydd yr athrawon yn adnabod yr holl blant, a bydd dolen gyswllt o ran y rhychwant o sgiliau sylfaenol sydd eu hangen. Bydd cydlynydd llythrennedd yn gyfrifol am lythrennedd—nid o fewn y sector cynradd yn unig neu'r sector uwchradd yn unig, ond am yr ystod oedran 3-19 cyfan. Bydd yr athro meithrin yn gwybod mai at bwrpas cael y plentyn i mewn i fyd gwaith neu i orffen ei daith yn yr ysgol wrth gymryd ei arholiadau lefel A y maent yn gwneud y pethau hyn gyda llythrennedd. Mae angen edrych ar hyn yn y cyd-destun cyflawn, yn hytrach na'i gyfyngu i un elfen.

One huge advantage, therefore, as we change our education infrastructure within the county council, is that we are creating schools that cover the 3-19 age range. We are moving away from the concept of the foundation phase and key stage 2 and 3—moving from nursery to year 3, then year 3 to year 9, and finally from year 9 until the end of the school experience. This will eradicate the problem of moving between the various stages. The teachers will know all of the children, and there will be a linkage with regard to the range of basic skills that are needed. There will be a literacy co-ordinator—not just in the primary sector or just in the secondary sector, but will cover the entire 3-19 age range. The teacher at nursery level will know that the reason why they are working on certain things in literacy is for the purpose of the pupil moving into the workplace or finishing their school experience at A-level. This must be considered in its broadest context, rather than limiting it to a single element.

[144] **Mr Thomas:** Yn ychwanegol at hynny, mae Ceredigion yn dibynnu'n drwm ar y sector cyhoeddus. Felly, rydym wedi dechrau'r drafodaeth yn adrannol i geisio cynnig cyfleodd i ddisgyblion ôl-16 a phobl sydd allan o'r ysgol ond ddim mewn gwaith ar hyn o bryd o fewn gwasanaethau'r cyngor. Mae modd dechrau trafodaeth gyda sefydliadau tebyg hefyd.

Mr Thomas: To add to that, Ceredigion depends heavily on the public sector. Therefore, we have opened up the discussion on a departmental basis to try to offer opportunities for post-16 pupils and people who are not in school but not in work at the moment within the council's services. There is room to open that discussion with similar institutions as well.

[145] Derbyniaf y pwynt a wneir ynghylch busnesau yn cynnig cyfleoedd, ond, gyda'r economi'n dynn, beth sy'n mynd i roi hwb i'r cwmnïau bach hyn? Dyna lle mae'n mynd yn anodd. Mae angen rhyw fath o gronfa i'w hysgogi, oherwydd rydym ar y funud mewn economi o *diminishing returns*—mae pobl yn torri a thorri. I roi enghraifft leol, roedd cymdogion inni yn arfer cyflogi mwy nag un person, ond maent wedi torri yn ôl, ac aelodau o'r teulu'n unig sy'n cael eu cyflogi yno bellach. Felly, mae'n mynd yn anoddach i'w agor allan heb fod rhyw gronfa i'w hyrwyddo.

I accept the point that is made regarding businesses offering opportunities, but, when the economy is tight, what will give a boost to those small companies? That is where it gets difficult. There needs to be some sort of fund to stimulate them, because we are currently in an economy of diminishing returns—people are cutting and cutting. To give you a local example, neighbours of ours used to employ more than one person, but they have cut back and it is just people within the family who are employed there now. So, it is getting more difficult to open it out without there being some sort of fund to

facilitate it.

[146] **Jocelyn Davies:** I just wanted to pick Mr Thomas up on something that he said earlier.

[147] **Mr Thomas:** Which one?

[148] **Jocelyn Davies:** You. [*Laughter.*] You mentioned Airbus having 500 apprenticeships, and you said that that is an encouragement for a son going into year 10. We have excellent translators here, so I am sure that that is what you said—

[149] **Mr Thomas:** I was referring to Simon's son.

[150] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay, but to put it on the record, I am sure that we would all recognise that apprenticeships are for girls as well, especially following the evidence that we had earlier today.

[151] **Mr Thomas:** For the record, that was lost in translation. [*Laughter.*]

[152] **Keith Davies:** Rwyf eisiau mynd yn ôl at yr *hub and spoke.* A yw hwnnw ar gyfer plant dros 16 oed ynteu ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 4? A yw'r 20 mewn un ysgol yn cyfeirio at blant o 14 i 19?

Keith Davies: I want to return to the hub and spoke. Is that for post-16 pupils or for key stage 4? Does the 20 within one school refer to pupils from 14 to 19?

[153] **Mr Evans:** Mae'n dibynnu'n llwyr ar y partneriaethau a fydd yn bodoli. Mae gennym enghraifft ar hyn o bryd rhwng dwy ysgol yn ne'r sir—mae un yn sir Gâr a'r llall yng Ngheredigion. Mae'r ysgolion hynny yn dechrau rhannu cyrsiau ar gyfer plant ôl 16 yn bennaf, ond mae enghreifftiau o blant 14 oed yn cyfnewid hefyd. Mae'r ddwy ysgol ar eu pennau eu hunain yn methu â fforddio cyflogi dau aelod o staff i ddarparu'r cyrsiau galwedigaethol penodol hyn yr ydym yn siarad amdanynt. Nid ydym yn siarad am y pynciau craidd a'r pynciau mwy academaidd, ond am ben draw'r daith—y pynciau galwedigaethol. Fodd bynnag, mae enghreifftiau o blant 14 oed yn cyfnewid a throsglwyddo rhwng ysgolion ac, yn ogystal, mae staff yn symud hefyd. Yn ddelfrydol, byddem yn hoffi osgoi symud plant cymaint ag y gallem a symud y staff yn lle hynny. Mae hynny'n cael ei wireddu i ryw raddau.

Mr Evans: It depends completely on the partnerships that will exist. We have an example at the moment between two schools in the south of the county—one is in Carmarthenshire and the other in Ceredigion. Those schools are beginning to share courses for children over the age of 16 mainly, but there are examples of children aged 14 exchanging as well. The two schools on their own cannot afford to employ two members of staff to provide these specific vocational courses that we are talking about. We are not talking about the core subjects or the more academic subjects, but about the end of the journey—the vocational subjects. However, there are examples of children aged 14 exchanging and transferring between schools and, in addition, staff are also moving. Ideally, we would like to avoid moving children as much as possible and to move staff instead. That is being achieved to some extent.

[154] Yng ngogledd y sir, mae gennym ddwy ysgol sydd yn datblygu'r math hwn o fodel, lle maent yn cyfnewid disgyblion ôl-16 yn unig, ond maent yn cydweithio ar rychwant eang o gyrsiau yno. Yng nghanol y sir, rydym yn sôn am gydweithio clòs rhwng tri sefydliad ac mae pedwerydd yn cynnig

In the north of the county, we have two schools that are developing this sort of model, where they exchange only post-16 students, but they are collaborating on a wide range of subjects there. In the middle of the county, we are talking about close collaboration between three institutions, with

cefnogaeth ychwanegol i'r *hub* hwnnw. Yng nghanol y sir yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio ar addysg ôl-16 yn unig—nid ydym wedi cyffwrdd â chyfnod allweddol 4 o gwbl hyd yma, dim ond addysg ôl-16. Gyda'r cyrsiau hynny, mae gennym gryn dipyn o bellter i fynd eto cyn inni wireddu hynny, ond yn ôl y llinell amser sydd gennym, mae'n rhaid bod hyn yn gwbl weithredol o fewn dwy flynedd.

a fourth offering additional support to that hub. In the middle of the county, we have only concentrated on post-16 education—we have not touched on key stage 4 at all so far, only post-16 education. With those courses, we have quite a way to go yet before we achieve that, but according to our timeline, this has to be fully operational within two years.

[155] **Suzy Davies:** Hoffwn symud ymlaen at y trefniadau cydweithio, yn arbennig gydag awdurdodau dros y ffin. A oes problemau yn codi o gydweithio gydag ysgolion mewn awdurdodau eraill lle mae'r model cydweithio mewnol yn wahanol, er enghraifft Powys neu sir Gaerfyrddin? A yw'r rheini yn ffitio'n dda?

Suzy Davies: I want to move on to collaborative arrangements, particularly with cross-border authorities. Do any problems arise from collaborating with schools from other authorities, where the internal collaboration model is different, for example Powys or Carmarthenshire? Do those fits work well?

[156] **Mr Evans:** Rydym yn croesi i faes arall, ond mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwneud hynny er mwyn ateb y cwestiwn. Mae'r gwaith rhanbarthol sydd wedi digwydd o fewn Consortiwm De-orllewin a Chanolbarth Cymru wedi caniatáu i'r cydweithio agos hwn lwyddo yn weddol ddidrafferth. Yn wahanol i'r consortia eraill drwy Gymru gyfan, dechreuasom drwy osod strategaeth ar waith. Ni ddaethom ati o gyfeiriad newid y strwythur a symud y cadeiriau o gwmpas y bwrdd er mwyn dangos ein bod wedi newid strwythur, ond dweud 'Dyma beth rydym yn anelu ato, dyma beth sydd angen i ni o fewn y rhanbarth ei osod ar y bwrdd er mwyn dangos bod gennym dargedau clir a phendant er mwyn codi safonau ar draws y rhanbarth fel un endid'. Mae gennym chwe blaenoriaeth glir ac rydym hefyd wedi datblygu system fandio sydd bellach yn cael ei rhannu drwy'r chwe sir sydd o fewn y rhanbarth. Rydym wedyn yn gwybod yn union sut mae pob ysgol yn perfformio o fewn ein system ddosbarthu ac rydym yn gallu dweud yn union ble mae'r cryfderau a'r gwendidau a sut y gallwn gael ysgolion i gydweithio gyda'i gilydd—maent yn ysgolion tebyg sydd efallai wedi wynebu'r un math o her. Gan fod yr aeddfedrwydd hwnnw yn y trafodaethau rhanbarthol, mae cydweithio trawsffiniol yn rhwydd iawn inni.

Mr Evans: We are crossing over into another area, but it is important that we do so in order to answer the question. The regional work that has taken place within the South West and Mid Wales Consortium has enabled this close collaboration to succeed without much difficulty. Unlike the other consortia throughout Wales, we started by putting a strategy in place. We did not come at it from the direction of changing the structure and moving the chairs around the table in order to show that we had changed the structure, but said 'This is what we're aiming for, this is what we within the region need to put on the table to show that we have clear and definite targets to raise standards across the region as a single entity'. We have six clear priorities and we have also developed a banding system that is now shared throughout the six counties within the region. We know precisely, therefore, how each school is performing within our categorisation system and we can tell you exactly where the strengths and weaknesses lie and how we can get schools to collaborate together—they are similar schools that may have faced a similar sort of challenge. It is because that maturity exists in the regional discussions that cross-border collaboration is very easy for us.

[157] Mae Powys yn anelu at yr un blaenoriaethau, ac yn dilyn yr un llwybr i wireddu'r un safonau ag y mae sir Gâr. Mae ein blaenoriaethau ni'n cydweddu â rhai'r

Powys is aiming for the same priorities, and following the same path to realise the same standards as Carmarthenshire. Our priorities match those of the Assembly, namely

Cynulliad, sef llythrennedd, rhifedd a thechnoleg gwybodaeth—maent i gyd yn flaenoriaethau clir gennym. Mae tlodi'n elfen bwysig arall, ond, yn ein rhanbarth ni, mae tlodi gwledig yn dod i mewn, a chredaf fod hwnnw yn mynd i raddau helaeth dan y radar, yn anffodus. Rhaid i ni geisio codi ymwybyddiaeth pobl o bwysigrwydd hwnnw. Nid yw tlodi yn y cyd-destun cul yr ydym yn tueddu ei ddyfynnu o angenrheidrwydd yn berthnasol i ardaloedd mwy gwledig. Mae'r sefyllfa wledig yn gallu cynnig tlodi gwahanol i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc ni. Mae angen i ni fod yn ymwybodol bod hwnnw'n bodoli. Rydych yn ôl wedyn i'r un teitl, sef trafnidiaeth.

literacy, numeracy and information technology—those are all clear priorities for us. Poverty is another important aspect, but, in our region, rural poverty comes into it, and I think that that to a large extent is under the radar, unfortunately. We have to try to raise people's awareness of its importance. Poverty, in the narrow context that we tend to quote it, is not necessarily relevant to the more rural areas. The situation in rural areas can present a different kind of poverty to our children and young people. We need to be aware of its existence. You then come right back to the same title, namely transport.

[158] **Suzy Davies:** Dyna'r safon strategol, wrth gwrs, ac rydym yn edrych ar y Mesur a'i effaith ymarferol. Rydych wedi esbonio rhai o'r manteision sydd yn gallu deillio o gydweithio dros ffiniau, ond ble mae'r anfanteision? Heb sôn gormod am drafnidiaeth—er ein bod yn siŵr o drafod hynny wedyn—sut yr ydych yn trefnu'r amserlen i gael tair awr gyda'i gilydd mewn bloc?

Suzy Davies: That is the strategic standard, of course, and we are looking at the Measure and its practical impact. You have explained some of the advantages that can arise from cross-border collaboration, but where do the disadvantages lie? Without going into transport too much—although I am sure that we will discuss that later—how do you arrange the timetable to get three hours together in a block?

[159] **Mr Evans:** Rydym wedi secondio rhywun i edrych ar gyd-amserlennu rhwng y sefydliadau. Felly, o fis Medi ymlaen, bydd ein hysgolion yng nghanol y sir yn gweithredu'r un amserlen, fel ein bod yn sichrau bod y plant, neu'r staff, yn gallu symud o un lle i'r llall er mwyn gwireddu hynny.

Mr Evans: We have seconded in somebody to look at joint timetabling between the establishments. So, from September onwards, our schools in the centre of the county will follow the same timetable, so that we ensure that the children, or staff, can move from one place to another to ensure that.

[160] Yn drawsffiniol, rydym hefyd wedi bod yn gweithio ar yr un egwyddor. Gan gymryd Ysgol Gyfun Gymundedol Penweddig ac Ysgol Bro Ddyfi fel enghraifft—mae Powys a Cheredigion yn cydweithio'n agos iawn—mae'r ddau bennaeth wedi dod ynghyd a chydnabod os ydynt i wireddu'r Mesur yn y tymor hir, ac os yw'r grant yn diflannu yn y tymor hir, mae angen iddynt ddarparu rhychwant o gyrsiau rhyngddynt fel eu bod yn bodloni gofynion pob unigolyn ac yn sicrhau ar yr un pryd effeithlonrwydd i'r ddau sefydliad yn y pen draw.

We have also been working according to the same principle across boundaries. Taking Ysgol Gyfun Gymundedol Penweddig and Ysgol Bro Ddyfi as an example—Powys and Ceredigion work very closely together—the two headteachers have come together and acknowledged that if they are to deliver the Measure in the long term, and if the grant is to disappear in the long term, they need to offer a range of courses between them so that they meet the needs of every individual and at the same time ensure efficiency for both establishments in the end.

[161] Mae gennym swyddogion o Bowys a Cheredigion yn cydweithio i gyd-gynllunio hyn. Nid ydym yn cynllunio hyn yng

We have officials in Powys and Ceredigion collaborating to plan these things jointly. We do not plan this in Ceredigion and then pick

Ngheredigion ac wedyn yn codi'r ffôn i Bowys a dweud, 'Gyda llaw, mae hyn wedi digwydd'. Mae ein swyddogion yn cydweithio. Os darllenwch y cais diweddaraf ar gyfer yr RNDP sydd i ddod i mewn, gwelwch fod yr elfennau cefnogi i'r ddwy ysgol hyn yn dod o'r ddwy sir yn gyson.

up the phone to Powys and say, 'By the way, this has happened'. Our officials collaborate. If you read the latest application under the RNDP that is to come into force, you will see that the supporting elements for these schools come from both counties consistently.

[162] **Mr Thomas:** Gan ddod yn ôl at y cwestiwn, nid yw'r ffiniau'n gwneud gwahaniaeth.

Mr Thomas: Coming back to the question, the boundaries do not make a difference.

[163] **Suzy Davies:** O ran darpariaeth o dan y Mesur?

Suzy Davies: To the provision under the Measure?

[164] **Mr Thomas:** Ie. Mae'r ffiniau traddodiadol sydd yn cadw pethau o fewn sir wedi cael eu torri i lawr, fel y mae Eifion wedi ei ddisgrifio. Mae yr un fath yn Aberteifi a Chastellnewydd Emlyn yn ne'r sir. Oni bai bod y ddwy'n cydweithio, ni fyddent yn gallu sefyll ar eu traed eu hunain. Hefyd, oherwydd eu daearyddiaeth— Peth artiffisial yw ffin.

Mr Thomas: Yes. The traditional boundaries that keep things within a county have been broken down, as Eifion has described. It is the same for Cardigan and Newcastle Emlyn in the south of the county. If they did not collaborate, they would not be able to stand on their two own feet. Also, because of their geography— A boundary is an artificial thing.

[165] **Suzy Davies:** Yr hyn rwyf yn ceisio'i ddweud yw bod awdurdodau sy'n fodlon mynd i system *hub and spoke*.

Suzy Davies: What I am trying to say is that there are authorities that are willing to go to a hub-and-spoke system.

[166] **Mr Thomas:** Oes. Nid oes gwrthwynebiad i hynny.

Mr Thomas: Yes. There is no opposition to that.

[167] **Mr Evans:** Mae un ffactor efallai nad ydym wedi cyffwrdd ag ef, sef y pellaf mae dyn yn mynd o Geredigion, y mwyaf amlwg mae'r broblem o gyfrwng y ddarpariaeth. Yn ysgolion Ceredigion, mae ein plant yn derbyn addysg gwbl ddwyieithog. Fodd bynnag, y pellaf mae dyn yn symud i ffwrdd o Geredigion tuag at ganol Powys, neu i gyfeiriad Abertawe neu sir Benfro, y mwyaf y bydd darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg yn dod yn broblem. Rydym yn ffodus gan ein bod yn rhannu ffin gyda sir Gâr a gogledd sir Benfro—nhw yw ein cymdogion agosaf—ac mae eu darpariaeth yn ddwyieithog; nid oes gwahaniaeth rhyngom. Fodd bynnag, y pellaf rydych yn ymestyn y ffin, y mwyaf y bydd hynny'n broblem.

Mr Evans: There is one factor that we perhaps have not touched upon, which is that the further one goes from Ceredigion, the more apparent the problem of the medium of the provision becomes. In Ceredigion's schools, our children receive a completely bilingual education. However, the further one moves away from Ceredigion towards central Powys, or in the direction of Swansea or Pembrokeshire, the more Welsh-medium provision will become a problem. We are fortunate in that we share a boundary with Carmarthenshire and north Pembrokeshire—they are our closest neighbours—and their provision is bilingual; there is no difference between us. However, the further you extend the boundary, the more that will become a problem.

[168] **Suzy Davies:** Mae hynny'n ddiddorol. Diolch.

Suzy Davies: That is interesting. Thank you.

[169] **Keith Davies:** Ar un amser, clywais

Keith Davies: At one time, I heard that

fod plant o Dywyn yn mynd i Benglais. Ni wn a yw'n digwydd o hyd, ond nid oeddech yn talu am hynny, na Gwynedd: y rhieni oedd yn talu.

children from Tywyn were going to Penglais. I do not know whether that still happens, but you were not paying for that, nor was Gwynedd: the parents were paying.

[170] **Mr Evans:** Mae'n dal i ddigwydd.

Mr Evans: It still happens.

[171] **Keith Davies:** A yw? A fydd y cydweithio'n arbed arian rywfodd neu'i gilydd? Rwy'n gwybod bod cludiant yn broblem, ac mae gennyf gwestiwn ychwanegol ar y pwnc hwnnw, ond a yw'r ffaith eich bod yn gweithio gyda'ch gilydd ac yn medru cynnig y cyrsiau hyn yn arbed arian?

Keith Davies: Does it? Will collaboration save money in one way or other? I know that transport is a problem, and I have a supplementary question on that subject, but is the fact that you are working together and are able to offer these courses saving money?

11.15 a.m.

[172] **Mr Evans:** Rhoddaf enghraifft real ichi o ran y ddarpariaeth yng nghanol y sir. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r sefydliadau, fel sefydliadau ar wahân, yn cynnig 72 o gyrsiau. Wrth ddefnyddio'r model *hub and spoke*, byddant yn cynnig dim ond 40, ond bydd y 40 hynny yn hollol gynaliadwy o fewn y sefydliadau. Os ydym yn caniatáu iddynt barhau fel ag y maent yn gweithredu ar hyn o bryd ar ôl i'r cymhorthdal ddiflannu, bydd pob un o'r sefydliadau hynny mewn trafferth ariannol ymhen dwy flynedd. Felly, wrth gydweithio, mae'n bosibl, ond mae'n rhaid bod gan y sefydliadau sy'n cydweithio ymddiriedaeth lwyr yn ei gilydd ac mae'n rhaid bod dealltwriaeth o beth yn union yw'r nod yn y pen draw.

Mr Evans: I will give you a real example with regard to provision in the middle of the county. At the moment, the institutions, as separate institutions, offer 72 courses. Using the hub-and-spoke model, they would offer only 40, but those 40 courses would be completely sustainable within those institutions. If we allow them to continue to operate as they are at present after the subsidy disappears, then all of those institutions will be in financial difficulties within two years. Therefore, through collaboration, it is possible, but the collaborating institutions must have complete trust in each other and they must have an understanding of the ultimate goal.

[173] Mae'n rhaid bod yn hollol dryloyw ynghylch hynny o'r cychwyn cyntaf. Nid oes pwrpas mynd i mewn i drafodaethau gydag unrhyw un o'r sefydliadau hyn a dweud, 'Dewch gyda ni a gwnawn ein gorau drosoch'; mae'n rhaid inni fod yn hollol oeraidd a dweud wrthynt fod hwn yn golygu na fydd yn bosibl iddynt redeg, er enghraifft, cwrs lefel-A cerddoriaeth yn yr ysgol hynny o fis Medi ymlaen. Dyna mae hwn yn ei olygu. Mae'n rhaid iddynt dderbyn hynny. Mae'r penderfyniadau yn seiliedig ar ddadansoddi data caled sy'n dangos beth sydd wedi digwydd dros y tair blynedd diwethaf. Hynny yw, dengys efallai fod tri disgybl wedi dewis y pwnc yn y flwyddyn gyntaf, dau yn yr ail, ac un yn y drydedd flwyddyn. Ni allant ddweud wedyn bod galw mawr am y pwnc yn eu hysgolion. Bydd

It is vital that there is complete transparency in that regard from the outset. There is no point going into negotiations with any of these institutions and saying, 'Come with us and we will do our best for you'; we must be completely dispassionate and tell them that this means it will not be possible to run, for example, an A-level music course at the school from September onwards. That is what this means. They must accept that. The decisions are based on the analysis of hard data that show what has happened over the last three years. That is, it might show that three pupils have chosen the subject in the first year, two in the second, and one in the third year. They cannot then say that there is great demand for the subject in their schools. Perhaps there will be one or two pupils who wish to study the subject, but we need to

efallai un neu ddau am astudio'r pwnc, ond mae angen inni newid y ffordd yr ydym yn ei ddarparu er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn gost-effeithiol yn y tymor hir.

change the way in which we provide it in order to ensure that it is cost-effective in the long term.

[174] **Keith Davies:** Rwyf yn gwybod bod hynny'n digwydd ym mhob ysgol. Bu ichi roi enghraifft lle'r oedd un disgybl am astudio'r gyfraith ond, wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n rhy gostus. Yn eich tystiolaeth, rydych yn sôn bod cost y cludiant yn £200,000. Rydych hefyd yn sôn bod hynny gyfwerth â phum athro. Beth sy'n mynd i ddigwydd yn y pen draw i'ch grant? Os bydd eich grant yn cael ei dorri, beth fyddwch yn ei dorri? A fyddwch yn cadw athrawon neu dorri yn ôl ar gludiant?

Keith Davies: I know that that happens in every school. You gave an example where one pupil wanted to study law but, of course, that is too expensive. In your evidence, you state that the transport costs are £200,000. You also mention that this is equivalent to five teachers. What is going to happen in the end to your grant? If your grant is cut, what would you cut? Would you keep teachers or cut back on transport?

[175] **Mr Thomas:** Dyna pam inni dweud ar y dechrau ein bod yn newid yr isadeiledd ar draws y gyfundrefn. Nid ydym yn disgwyl i'r darn hon o'r gyfundrefn addysg i edrych ar y gyllideb yn y ffordd hon. Rydym yn gwybod bod cynnydd yn y nifer o ddisgyblion sy'n dechrau dod i mewn i waelod y cynradd—ac rwyf yn pwysleisio mai ar waelod y cynradd mae'r cynnydd. Bydd y niferoedd yn y sector yn sylweddol is dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Felly, bydd deinameg yr *hub and spoke* yn newid fel y bydd y boblogaeth yn dirywio ac yna bydd angen ail-fodelu yn eithaf rheolaidd yr hyn rydym yn ei gynnig. Felly, mae'n rhaid cael yr isadeiledd yn iawn ar gyfer disgyblion rhwng tair a 19 oed neu byddwn yn gorfod symud o un i'r llall yn gyson. Rydym yn ceisio sicrhau hynny drwy'r model *hub and spoke*, oherwydd, wrth i chi ddechrau modelu yn y modd y mae Eifion wedi ei ddisgrifio, mae effaith wedyn ar lefelau staffio yn yr ysgolion uwchradd. Pan fydd bwlch yn agor yn y dyfodol, bydd yn rhaid imi ymgynghori gyda fy mhartneriaid i weld beth yn union yw'r galw. Rydym yn edrych yn y dyfodol at gyfnod allweddol 3 yn arbennig a fydd yn edrych yn debycach i'r cynradd na'r uwchradd traddodiadol. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried.

Mr Thomas: This is why we said at the start that we are changing the infrastructure across the system. We do not expect this piece of the education system to look at the budget in this way. We know that there is an increase in the number of pupils who are starting to come through into the bottom of the primary sector—I emphasise that that is at the bottom of the primary sector. The numbers in the secondary sector will be significantly less over the coming years. Thus, the dynamics of the hub-and-spoke model will change as the population declines and we will then need to re-model what we offer quite regularly. So it is vital that we have the right infrastructure for pupils aged three to 19 or we will have to move from one to another frequently. We are trying to ensure that through the hub-and-spoke model, because, as you begin to model in the way that Eifion described, there is a knock-on effect then on staffing levels in the secondary schools. When a gap opens in the future, I will have to consult with my partners to see exactly what the demand is. We are looking in the future at a key stage 3 in particular that will look more like the primary sector than the traditional secondary sector. That is something that we have to consider.

[176] **Mr Evans:** Nid yw'r allwedd i'r arbedion sydd angen inni eu gwneud yn y Mesur yn unig. Yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud, a chredaf ein bod wedi llwyddo i wneud hyn dros y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf, yw edrych ar y ddarpariaeth fel un pecyn, er bod

Mr Evans: The key to the savings that we need to make are not in the Measure alone. What we need to do, and what I think that we have been successful in doing over the last three or four years, is to look at the provision as one package, although there are different

ffynonellau gwahanol i ariannu gwahanol feysydd. Er enghraifft, mae grant i gefnogi'r cyfnod sylfaen, rydym yn derbyn swm sylweddol ar gyfer plant ag anghenion arbennig, rydym hefyd yn derbyn swm sylweddol o arian ar gyfer addysg 14-19, ac yn y blaen. Os ydym yn ceisio delio â'r rheiny fel eitemau unigol, ni fyddwn byth yn gwireddu'r hyn rydym yn ceisio ei wneud.

sources of funding for different areas. For example, there is a subsidy to support the foundation phase, we receive a substantial sum for children with special needs and we also receive a significant amount of funding for 14-19 education, and so on. If we try to deal with those as individual items, we will never achieve what we want to achieve.

[177] Beth sydd angen ei wneud yw creu strategaeth sy'n edrych ar y ddarpariaeth fel pecyn cyflawn. Rydym wedi gwneud cryn dipyn o waith—a maddeuwch i mi am wyro ychydig, ond credaf y deallwch y cyd-destun pan ddôf yn ôl ato—ar adolygu'r system cefnogi plant ag anghenion arbennig o fewn y sir. Roedd y system flaenorol yn eithaf *perverse* mewn ffordd, oherwydd roedd yn gwobrwyo methiant. Y mwyaf o blant oedd ar y gofrestr anghenion arbennig, y mwyaf o arian roeddem ni fel cyngor sir yn ei daflu ato. Gyda phob ewyllys da yn y byd, nid yw arian yn datrys bob problem. Beth sydd angen yw systemau a phrosesau clir a chadarn sy'n rhoi'r gefnogaeth briodol mewn ffordd cost-effeithiol.

What you need to do is create a strategy that looks at the provision as a complete package. We have done a great deal of work—and forgive me for going off on a tangent, but I think that you will understand the context when I come back to it—on reviewing the system of supporting children with special educational needs within the county. The previous system was quite perverse in a way, in that it rewarded failure. The more children you had on the special needs register, the more money that we as a county council threw at it. With the best will in the world, money does not solve every problem. What we need are clear and robust systems and processes that provide the appropriate support in a cost-effective way.

[178] Mae Arwyn wedi arwain yn y maes hwn ac wedi adolygu'r broses o'r top i'r gwaelod. Mae hynny wedi creu arbedion anferthol i ni o fewn yr adran. Gan ein bod ni wedi creu'r arbedion hynny, mae'r arian wedyn wedi cael ei ailfuddsoddi, ac mae hynny'n clymu mewn gyda phwynt blaenorol Simon a'm hateb i am sgiliau sylfaenol. Bwydwyd peth o'r arian hynny yn ôl i mewn i'r system yn benodol ar gyfer hyrwyddo llythrennedd a rhifedd o fewn yr ysgolion. Yr unig beth roeddem yn gofyn o'r ysgolion wedyn oedd iddynt greu cynllun gweithredu clir ynglŷn â'u strategaethau, yn unol â'n dymuniadau ni i hyrwyddo llythrennedd a rhifedd. Mae rhai o'r arbedion hynny yn gallu mynd yn erbyn ychydig o'r pwysau ychwanegol sy'n dod o ganlyniad i'r ffaith y bydd costau trafnidiaeth ychwanegol ar gyfer darpariaeth 14 i 19. Felly, os oes prinder arian ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen, nid ydym yn edrych ar hynny fel problem y cyfnod sylfaen yn unig; mae'n broblem i'r is-adeiledd addysg yn gyfan gwbl. Os ydym yn gwirioneddol barchu'r egwyddorion hynny, rhaid i ni ddarganfod ffyrdd o'u cefnogi. Os ydym yn penderfynu bod angen i rwybeth

Arwyn has led in this area and has reviewed the process from top to bottom. That has created substantial savings for us within the department. As we have created those savings, the money has been reinvested, and that ties in to Simon's previous point, which I answered by speaking about basic skills. Some of that money was fed back into the system specifically for promoting literacy and numeracy in schools. The only thing that we asked from the schools was that they created a clear action plan for their strategies, in line with our aspiration to promote numeracy and literacy. Some of those savings can be set against some of the additional pressures resulting from the fact that there will be additional transport costs for 14 to 19 provision. So, if there is not enough money for the foundation phase, we do not look at that as a problem for the foundation phase alone; it is a problem for the education infrastructure as a whole. If we really respect those principles, we have to find ways of supporting them. If we decide that something has to go, and we feel that something is a waste of time and resources, then that is what we sacrifice in order to realise—

fynd a bod rhywbeth yn wastraff adnodd ac amser, dyna'r hyn a aberthwn er mwyn gwireddu—

[179] **Keith Davies:** Fy nghestiwn nesaf, ond rydych wedi ei ateb mewn ffordd, yw pe bai'r grant RNDP yn cael ei dorri, a fyddai'n effeithio ar y dewisiadau y gallech eu cynnig i fyfyrwyr? Fodd bynnag, mae'r un cwestiwn yn codi pe gollwch y grant ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen.

Keith Davies: My next question, and you have answered it in a way, is if the RNDP grant is cut, would that affect the options that you could offer students? However, the same question would arise if you lost the foundation phase grant.

[180] **Mr Evans:** Ydy. Mae'n union yr un peth.

Mr Evans: Yes. It is exactly the same.

[181] **Mr Thomas:** Dyna pam—rydym yn ailadrodd ein hunain yma—mae'n rhaid edrych ar y gyfundrefn yn ei chyfanrwydd a bod yn glir ynghylch beth yw'r gwerthoedd sy'n gyrru drwyddi.

Mr Thomas: That is why—we are repeating ourselves here—we need to look at the system as a whole and to be clear about what the values driving that system are.

[182] **Christine Chapman:** I apologise to Members, but we have to move on to some other areas. Time is a bit tight now. I will move on to Aled.

[183] **Aled Roberts:** Dychwelaf at y costau trafnidiaeth. Mae'ch papur yn dweud eich bod yn gwario rhyw £465 y pen ar drafnidiaeth ar hyn o bryd, a bod y baich hwnnw yn syrthio ar yr awdurdod a'r ysgolion. Pa mor gynaliadwy yw hynny, ac a ydych yn ystyried rhoi'r baich ar y plant, fel mae rhai awdurdodau yn ei wneud ar gyfer darpariaeth ôl-16?

Aled Roberts: I will go back to transport costs. Your paper states that you spend about £465 per head on transport at the moment, and that that burden falls on the authority and the schools. How sustainable is that, and are you considering placing the burden on the children, as some authorities are doing for post-16 provision?

[184] **Mr Evans:** Mae'n gwestiwn diddorol. Eto, mae'n ddatrusiad i ardaloedd mwy poblog, ond ni fyddai'n ddatrusiad i gefn gwlad oherwydd mae'n rhaid i ni ddarparu systemau cludiant eithaf unigryw i gefn gwlad Cymru. Mae'r bysys hyn yn rhedeg drwy bentrefi bach. Nid ydym yn siarad am fws enfawr yma; rydym yn siarad am fws mini, neu dacsi mewn nifer o achlysuron efallai. Mae lleoedd gwag arnynt ac maent wedyn yn gallu casglu'r plant ôl-16. Pe byddem yn troi rownd ac yn dweud nad ydym yn talu am blant ôl-16, byddem yn dal yn gorfod darparu cludiant ar hyd union yr un llwybrau, ac ni allwn dorri un cerbyd allan achos mae gymaint o gerbydau gwahanol yn gwasanaethu. Felly, mae'n gost na allwn ei osgoi.

Mr Evans: It is an interesting question. Again, it is a solution for more densely populated areas, but it would not be a solution for rural areas because we have to provide unique transport solutions in rural Wales. These buses run through small villages. We are not talking about huge buses here; we are talking about minibuses, or even taxis, perhaps, in a number of cases. There are empty spaces on them and we can then pick up the post-16 pupils. If we were to turn around and say that we are not going to pay for post-16 pupils, we would still have to provide transport along the very same routes, and we could not cut out one vehicle because there are so many different vehicles serving these areas. Therefore, it is a cost that we cannot avoid.

[185] Yr unig beth rydym wedi'i wneud—ac mae hwn hefyd yn bwysig i'w nodi, ac yn

The only thing that we have done—and this is also important to note, and demonstrates

dangos maint y broblem sy'n ein wynebu—oedd ystyried, pan oeddem yn creu'r ddogfen adolygu ar ddarpariaeth addysg uwchradd yn benodol o fewn y sir, creu un gwasanaeth system trydyddol a'i leoli yng nghanol y sir. Byddai hynny'n golygu cau pob chweched dosbarth a rhoi'r coleg addysg bellach ar un campws i ganol y sir, a dod â phob plentyn ôl-16 i un lleoliad. Mae'n swnio'n ddelfrydol, ond y sioc enfawr a gawsom oedd bod y gost o gludo'r plant o'u lleoliadau presennol i'r canol yn fwy na gadael i'r sefydliadau presennol barhau fel ag y maent. Dyna faint y broblem drafnidiaeth sydd gennym yng nghefn gwlad Cymru. Os yw fel yna i ni, mae'n mynd i fod yn waeth i Bowys, druan.

the scale of the problem—was to consider, when we were drawing up the review of secondary education within the county, creating one tertiary system and locating it at the centre of the county. That would mean closing every sixth form and putting the further education college on one campus into the centre of the county, and bringing all the post-16 pupils to one location. It sounds ideal of course, but the huge shock that we had was that the cost of transporting the children from their current locations to that central point would be greater than allowing the current institutions to continue as they are. That is the scale of the transport problem that we have in rural Wales. If it is like that for us, it is going to be even worse for poor Powys.

[186] **Mr Thomas:** I barhau ag ail ran y cwestiwn, os ydym yn trosglwyddo'r gost i'r sector ôl-16, mae tensiwn pan fo'r ddaprariaeth statudol yn gorffen yn 16 oed. Unwaith eto, os ydym yn rhoi'r gost hon ar y rhieni—o ystyried mai cyfartaledd cyflog Ceredigion yw'r isaf yng Nghymru—rydym yn ychwanegu at dlodi gwledig. Felly, rydym yn wirioneddol mewn cylch dieflig.

Mr Thomas: To continue with the second part of the question, if we transfer the cost to the post-16 sector, there is tension where statutory provision ends at the age of 16. Once again, if we transfer this cost to parents—given that Ceredigion's average wage is the lowest in Wales—we are adding to rural poverty. Therefore, we really are in a vicious circle.

[187] Beth rydym yn ceisio'i ddisgrifio yw pwysigrwydd y gwerthoedd o fewn y gyfundrefn, ond rwyf yn meddwl ein bod yn cael ein cosbi'n or-hallt nad yw trafnidiaeth yn cael ei hystyried yn rhan bwysig o'r gyllideb hon. Gyda 10% o'r gyllideb hon a'r arian cynllun datblygu rhwydwaith rhanbarthol er mwyn hyrwyddo dewisiadau, gallem wneud cryn dipyn, ond mae'n rhaid i ni hefyd ddiogelu'r economi. Mewn ffordd mae'n fuddsoddiad yn yr economi leol, oherwydd rydym yn cadw arian ym mhocedi'r rhieni. Rydym wedi gweithio'n galed i leihau'r nifer o bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth a hyfforddiant sydd gennym. Dengys ein dadansoddiadau nad problem drefol mohoni ond problem lleoedd gwledig, lle mae mynediad i gyfleoedd, nid rhai addysg yn unig, ond gwasanaethau fel hamdden ac yn y blaen, yn mynd yn bellach o'u cyrraedd. Pe baem yn cymryd yr arian hwnnw o bocedi'r rhieni, byddem yn lleihau'r cyfleoedd iddynt wneud pethau eraill hefyd. Mae gwir densiwn lleol i ni fynd i'r afael ag ef.

What we are trying to describe is the importance of the values within the system, but I think that we are too harshly penalised for not considering transport as an important part of this budget. With 10% of this budget and the RNDP money to promote options, we could do a great deal, but we also have to safeguard the economy. In a way, it is an investment in the local economy, because we are keeping money in parents' pockets. We have worked hard on reducing the number of NEETS that we have. Our analysis demonstrates that it is not an urban problem, but an issue in rural areas, where access to opportunities, not only educational ones but leisure services and so on, is further from their grasp. If we took that money from parents' pockets, we would be reducing the opportunities for them to do other things as well. There is real local tension that we have to address.

[188] **Christine Chapman:** I remind Members that we just have 10 minutes left.

[189] **Jenny Rathbone:** Moving on from that, and given that your population density is not going to change anytime soon, I am surprised that you have not given more focus to your digital learning. In your conclusion, it is not in your list of must-dos. The Government is investing over £50 million in developing broadband across Wales; where does this sit in your priorities?

[190] **Mr Evans:** Ceredigion is probably one of the worst connected areas, as far as broadband is concerned, in Wales at present. We run video-conferencing connections—some of the courses provided in the hub-and-spoke model are delivered through this medium. That is already in place. The real danger is that we must not put too many of our eggs in that one basket. When you deliver courses to children through video-conferencing, you lose that close interaction. It is the main reason why we have travelled here today: if we were talking to you on a screen, you would lose that close engagement, the interaction and the body language. Likewise, that happens when a teacher is delivering a lesson to a group of children through video-conferencing. It is fine to use it as a teaching resource and tool, but it is not a long-term solution.

[191] The other element that you refer to is creating virtual learning libraries and so on. That is another key element to our work. We have done a substantial amount of work on that and we have started discussions with Aberystwyth University about its systems that, possibly, we can interact with. Again, it is only a bank of resources. You still need interaction to ensure that the learner understands. The key message that we give to all staff is that all children can learn, but not in the same way and on the same day. The key to that is the person delivering the work. If the person delivering it is a good-quality teacher, they will recognise that, when they are talking to a group of people and an individual is disengaged, they need to change the way they are delivering this message and ensure that each child in the classroom understands. Even at post-16 level, that is still relevant. We need that interaction. I am not dismissing it, and by no means am I belittling the Welsh Government's investment, but within our context, it is part of the solution and it can never be the whole situation.

[192] **Mr Thomas:** One of the other points that we made in our submission was that, with 14-19 provision, we have invested in behavioural support and the emotional development of children through the *hafan and encil* schemes in each secondary school. It is about engagement. It does not matter what background you are from; most individuals are vulnerable at some point during the secondary years. It gives them an opportunity to share what they feel at that point in time.

11.30 a.m.

[193] The outcome of that, which is the key point that Eifion made about engagement at individual level, is what we have seen through the broadening of the curriculum—more choices and opportunities, tailoring learning to the individual, as well as providing social support. That has seen a reduction in permanent exclusions, a reduction in fixed-term exclusions and a significant improvement in attendance.

[194] **Jenny Rathbone:** I do not disagree with you on that, but I am still mindful of the young person who wanted to study law but could not do anything. I agree that it is only one tool in the box, but, for an area like yours, it must be an important tool. You say that you are investigating whether you are going to commission electronic course materials. The school in Cardiff where I am a governor already has those options, so I am surprised that you have not got them.

[195] **Mr Evans:** Let us go back one step. The capacity of the broadband system that goes into one of the schools in the hub-and-spoke model only allows it to run one video-

conferencing tutor. Inevitably, during the timetable, only one course at a time can be run through the system. The connection between other schools and the partnership mirrors that. It is a slow system, which is frustrating to the learner.

[196] **Jenny Rathbone:** I agree; so why is it not top of your list?

[197] **Mr Evans:** I do not see it as our long-term solution. My long-term solution is having teachers in front of children. That is the best way for children to learn. I do not dispute the use of tools of any sort. The more resources that we have in the tool box, the better, but you can never move away from the importance of having a classroom teacher, facing a group of children. That will always be priority No. 1 for me.

[198] **Mr Thomas:** This morning, if we were in Aberystwyth doing this by video-conference, we would have lost sight of each other, we would have to keep to time, people would be getting frustrated, people would want to come in and we could only see one picture. At the end of a video-conferencing class session, a pupil who wanted to see the teacher because they did not understand something would not want to ask in front of everyone else.

[199] **Christine Chapman:** We have a few minutes left, so I am going to move on to Welsh-medium provision.

[200] **Aled Roberts:** Rydych yn dweud yn eich tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig bod cynnydd sylweddol wedi bod mewn darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog. Sut y cyflawnwyd hynny? Mae problemau ledled Cymru ynglŷn â'r galw a'r ddarpariaeth.

Aled Roberts: You say in your written evidence that there has been a substantial increase in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. How was that achieved? There are problems across Wales to do with the demand and provision.

[201] **Mr Evans:** I ddechrau, roedd yn rhaid inni greu strategaeth iaith newydd yn y sir. O fewn y strategaeth honno, roedd rhaid i bob ysgol ar draws y sir osod eu hunain ar gontinwwm ieithyddol. Ar y continwwm hwnnw roedd angen iddynt, o fewn eu cynllun datblygu ysgol, ddangos yn glir sut roeddent am symud ar hyd y continwwm, nid i fod yn uniaith Gymraeg ond i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth yn gwbl ddwyieithog a bod y plant yn cael eu trwytho'n llwyr yn y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg, fel bod eu dealltwriaeth o'r ddwy iaith yn hafal.

Mr Evans: First, we needed to create a new language strategy in the county. Within that strategy, every school across the county had to place themselves on a linguistic continuum. On that continuum, within their school development plans, they had to clearly demonstrate how they were going to progress along the continuum, not to become Welsh-medium schools but to ensure that provision is fully bilingual and that the children are immersed in both English and Welsh and that there is equality in their understanding of both languages.

[202] O ganlyniad, mae nifer y disgyblion sydd wedi trosglwyddo o gyfnod allweddol 2 i gyfnod allweddol 3 sy'n aros mewn ffrydiau dwyieithog a phrif ffrwd Cymraeg wedi cynyddu bellach i 78%, sy'n swm sylweddol iawn. Ni fyddwn yn synnu pe bai hynny hyd yn oed yn uwch na Gwynedd erbyn hyn, sy'n dangos maint y cynnydd sydd wedi digwydd.

As a result, the number of pupils transferred from key stage to 2 to key stage 3 who have stayed in bilingual streams or in Welsh-medium mainstream has increased to 78%, which is a very substantial number. I would not be surprised if it was even higher than Gwynedd at present, which shows how much progress there has been.

[203] O ran rhychwant y cyrsiau galwedigaethol a gynigir dan y Mesur 14-19, gan ein bod yn siarad yn benodol am gyrsiau o fewn yr ysgolion, mae'r ysgolion yn cyflogi

With regard to the range of vocational courses provided under the 14-19 Measure, as we are talking specifically about these courses running in schools, the schools

staff dwyieithog a all gynnig y ddarpariaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu'n ddwyieithog, yn ôl y galw. Mae gennym nifer o blant cefn gwlad yn gwneud cyrsiau galwedigaethol sy'n naturiol yn dewis addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, felly gallwn barhau i fodloni'r gofynion hynny ar gyfer y cyrsiau galwedigaethol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

employ bilingual staff who can offer provision through the medium of Welsh or bilingually according to demand. We have a number of children in rural areas doing vocational courses who naturally opt for Welsh-medium education, so we can continue to meet those demands for the vocational courses through the medium of Welsh.

[204] **Aled Roberts:** Mae hwn yn eithaf anodd i ni ddeall. Sut mae'r cwrs yn cael ei redeg yn ddwyieithog pan nad yw canran o'r disgyblion yn deall Cymraeg?

Aled Roberts: This is quite difficult for us to understand. How is the course run bilingually when a percentage of the pupils do not understand Welsh?

[205] **Mr Evans:** Rydym yn naturiol yn symud rhwng y ddwy iaith; maddeuwch i mi am eiliad, oherwydd fy mod i'n symud i ffwrdd o'r pwynt rhyw ychydig, ond byddwch yn deall y cyd-destun. Fel rhan o'r strategaeth iaith, rydym yn darparu ymyrraeth ddwys ar gyfer hwyrddyfodiaid i'r sir. Felly, mae gennym ganolfannau iaith lle bydd plant sy'n symud i Geredigion yn hwyr yn eu bywydau yn cael tymor cyfan o'u trwytho yn yr iaith Gymraeg. Maent wedyn yn meddu ar sgiliau digonol i ymdopi â chyfathrebu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu'r Saesneg. Yn ystod y gwersi hynny, bydd yr athro yn symud o un iaith i'r llall, a bydd yn cyflwyno ac yn ymateb i gwestiynau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu'r Saesneg ac oherwydd bod y plant yn meddu ar y sgiliau angenrheidiol yn y ddwy iaith a'u bod yn ddwyieithog, nid yw symud o un iaith i'r llall yn broblem. Gwelsom enghraifft o hynny yma heddiw. Mae'n anodd i bobl nad ydynt yn ddwyieithog ddeall sut mae hynny'n bosibl. Y gymhariaeth yw'r hyn sy'n digwydd gydag ysgolion penodedig cyfrwng Cymraeg ac ysgolion penodedig cyfrwng Saesneg, sef y patrwm yng Nghymoedd y de—

Mr Evans: We naturally move between the two languages; forgive me for a moment, because I am straying away from the point a little, but you will understand the context. As part of the language strategy, we provide intensive immersion for latecomers into the county. So, we have a language centre where children who move into Ceredigion at a late stage in their lives have a full term of immersion in the Welsh language. They then have adequate skills to cope with communication through the medium of either Welsh or English. During those lessons, the teacher will move from one language to the other and will present and respond to questions through the medium of Welsh or English, and as the children have adequate skills in both languages and are bilingual, moving from one language to the other is not a problem. We have seen an example of that here today. It is difficult for people who are not bilingual to understand how that can be possible. The comparison is what happens with specific Welsh-medium schools and specific English-medium schools, which is the pattern in the south Wales Valleys—

[206] **Aled Roberts:** Neu'r gogledd-ddwyrain.

Aled Roberts: Or in north-east Wales.

[207] **Mr Thomas:** Dyna beth mae angen ei ddisgrifio. Nid oes gennym y ddau begwn—rydym yn 'hybrid'.

Mr Thomas: That is what we need to describe. We do not have those two extremes—we are a hybrid.

[208] **Aled Roberts:** Faint o'r 78% a fyddai'n sefyll arholiad drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

Aled Roberts: How many of that 78% would sit an examination through the medium of Welsh?

[209] **Mr Thomas:** Byddai'r 78% yn sefyll arholiad drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae hwn yn ymwneud â phwynt Eifion ar y continwwm iaith. Ar y continwwm hwnnw, byddent yn dewis cymryd dau, tri neu hyd yn oed pob un o'u cyrsiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, lle bynnag y maent yn gweld eu hunain ar y continwwm iaith, yn ogystal ag ystyried pa opsiynau sydd ar gael iddynt mewn mannau penodol. Dyna lle mae'r cydweithio a'r cynllunio gofalus yn gorfod digwydd rhwng y gwahanol bartneriaid. Mae fel Sudoku 3D—mae angen i chi gael y cyfrwng addysgu ar ben bob un o'r opsiynau sydd ar gael.

Mr Thomas: The 78% would sit an examination through the medium of Welsh. This relates to Eifion's point about the language continuum. On that continuum, they would opt to take two, three or even all of their courses through the medium of Welsh, according to wherever they see themselves on the language continuum, as well as considering what options are available to them at specific locations. That is where collaboration and careful planning has to happen between the various partners. It is like a 3D Sudoku—you need the medium of teaching on top of all of the options available.

[210] **Jocelyn Davies:** Last week, we heard evidence from young people—I think that they were based in Cardiff—who said that some pupils had dropped out of Welsh-medium science because they were concerned that they would not then know the terms in English when they went on to university. Would the teaching of science in your counties be done bilingually so that students know those terms in English and in Welsh? Perhaps my question is too technical.

[211] **Mr Thomas:** No, you are not being too technical, but we do not want you to get the idea that all of our lessons are bilingual—it depends on the size of the group. As Eifion has indicated with our Welsh-language strategy, around three-quarters of the children will follow a first language throughout their primary education and be expected to follow it into key stages 3 and 4. You would then expect them to be confident in dealing with the terminology in Welsh. However, due to their own preference or because their parents feel, rightly or wrongly, that they can better support their children in another language, some will opt for the other language, and that option is available in some schools that offer science through the medium of Welsh or English. As they grow into post-16 education, there is this age-old thinking—which is wrong in my opinion—that you cannot translate that terminology into another language once you go to university. There is literally no difference between learning history or geography—

[212] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, but the point that the young people made is that they would not know the term in English because they had never come across it. As a monoglot, whose children were educated through the medium of Welsh, helping them with their mathematics homework when they had never used the term 'subtract' in school, made me want to chew the carpet. [*Laughter.*] These young people told us that they had evidence that young people were dropping out of science subjects because they did not know the terms in English. That is the evidence we had just last week. However, as you were saying, through the system you have, pupils could be confident—

[213] **Mr Thomas:** It is about individual choice. You need confidence that, as an individual, you have to make that decision. Three of my own children are over 16 now, and it is about how confident they feel at that point in time. For one of the children, the most difficult step is the one up to university where the next stage of learning will start. Again, if you are confident in the two languages you can go backwards and forwards between the two with confidence.

[214] **Jocelyn Davies:** I think that was the problem is, was it not? It was influencing children's choices in the schools those children came from.

[215] **Mr Evans:** I have had an interesting debate with parents on this issue, and the reason I can understand where you are coming from is that I was born and bred in the Valleys here. I went to Rhydfelen secondary school. Everything was taught through the medium of Welsh. When we moved to Lampeter to live, it did not matter in which language I spoke to the children there—they understood me. The difference is that bilingual education genuinely brings children up to understand comfortably in both languages. Those children can make equal choices and confident choices in both. This is possibly the argument we need to have: should we be moving towards a bilingual system right across Wales to ensure that all schools are bilingual, rather than having specific Welsh-language schools and English-language schools?

[216] **Aled Roberts:** Is the language strong enough in the anglicised areas?

[217] **Mr Evans:** Not at the moment.

[218] **Jocelyn Davies:** However, we know that it is about implementing children's choices.

[219] **Christine Chapman:** I think that we will have to continue this debate another day. Thank you for your evidence this morning and for coming here. There were a few other areas that we wanted to talk to you about, so, if you are happy, we will send the questions to you and ask that you respond in writing. We will send you a transcript of the meeting to check for factual accuracy. Thank you for coming today.

Cynnig Gweithdrefnol
Procedural Motion

[220] **Christine Chapman:** I move that

the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.42(vi).

[221] I see that the committee is in agreement.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 11.42 a.m.
The public part of the meeting ended at 11.42 a.m.